إنجليزي

Spurious Arguments ABOUT THE SHIA

شبهات حول الشيعة

BY
Ayatulla Abu Talib Al-Tabrizi

Translated BY
Abdullah Al-Shahin

بسم الله الرحمن الرحیم

SPURIOUS ARGUMENTS ABOUT THE SHIA

:Writer

Ayatulla Abu Talib Tajlil at- Tabrizi

:Published in print

Ansariyan

:Digital Publisher

Ghaemiyeh center of computerized researches

Contents

SPURIOUS ARGUMENTS ABOUT THE SHIA

ID Book

Author: Ayatulla Abu Talib Tajlil at- Tabrizi

Translator: Abdullah al- Shahin

Editor: Ahmed Haneef

Publisher: Ansariyan Publications – Qum

First Edition ۲۰۰۱ - ۱۳۸۰ - ۱۴۲۲

second Edition ۲۰۰۵ - ۱۳۸۴ - ۱۴۲۶

Thamin Ali-a'immah Press

Quantity: ۲۰۰۰

Number of pages: ۱۲۰

Size: ۱۴۵ x ۲۱۰ mm

ISBN: ۹۶۴-۴۳۸-۳۳۸-۹

PREFACE

All Praise is due to Allah, the Lord of the Universe. And Allah's blessing and peace be upon .our Prophet Muhammad and his progeny

We, the Shias, have been accustomed to meeting with accusations and have had to put up with them. The accusations against us started on the death of our Prophet (blessings and peace be upon him) and thus we were made the adversary in the history of Islam. As the adversary we have had to bear the persecution and torture of the ruling authorities .and the accusations, annoyance, and hurt from people

Throughout the ages, there was no difference in this state of affairs except in the severity

of the attack. Sometimes, something would happen to make the accusation and persecution a little lighter, and then something else would be the cause for a strong .assault or set an excuse for another attack

What occurred in our time was that the Shia committed a great sin and made a serious mistake. According to a verdict issued by the leading religious authority, the Shia in Iran revolted against their shah. The West and the Jews became very angry with this, as were the rulers of many Muslim countries. They started their activities against the Shiite state. It was not long before the anger reached the books and the writers inimical to the Shia and a new attack arose against the Shiism. The old accusations of the Umayyad State .were repeated in a new dress, looking for a new axe to grind

p: ۱

What could be the aim of such writers and editors? Were these works done with good ?intentions, or is there a logical way to interpret them

Anyone can analyze and arrive at the conclusion that our time is a peculiar time just as history has been a peculiar history with respect to the Shia! We have been fated to be always paying the price, to put up with the fabrications and lies that have accumulated against us, we must witness, in our time, the alliance between enemy and foreigner, and then we are told: Silence! Do not defend yourselves, if you want us to recognize your Islam, you have to disavow the Prophet's progeny whom he (s) ordered us to follow along !with the Qur'an

Anti Shia attacks had reached such a degree that writers among our Sunni brothers had to refute some of these accusations. They said; why do you slander and level accusations against a respected sect known for a long time in the history of Islam for their great love ?for the Prophet and his progeny

Perhaps, the idiocy of the accusers and the weakness of their proofs made thousands of learned Muslims search for Shiism to find their long-sought goal, and declare the honour of belonging to it. But that did not take the responsibility away from the ulama. As a result, some of the Shiite ulama set out to answer the accusations. One of them was the great pious Sheikh Abu Talib at-Tabrizi, to whom we offered some of these accusations and he .conceded to write these chapters

p: ٢

Darul- Qur’anul-Kareem

Ali al-Kurani al-Aamili

.A.H ٢٣/۵/١۴١٧

The First Spurious Argument

SEEING ALLAH

Some people spuriously criticize the Shia for saying that it is impossible to see Allah whether in this world or in the Afterlife, and they quote some prophetic traditions saying .that Allah can be seen in the Afterlife

The answer

:Allah says

Vision comprehends Him not, and He comprehends all vision; and He is the Knower of (Subtleties, the Aware. (۶:١٠٣

(He, the Almighty, also says—addressing the Prophet Moses (a): You will not see Me. (٧:١۴٣

:(Az-Zamakhshary says in his book al-Inmuzage (TheExample

((.LAN —Will not means never; so the verse proves that Allah cannot be seen at all))

:He, the Almighty, also says

:And those who do not hope for Our meeting say

Why have not angels been sent down upon us, or (why) do we not see our Lord? Now certainly they are too proud of themselves and have revolted in great revolt. On the day when they shall see the angels, there shall be no joy on that day for the guilty, and they :shall say

(It is a forbidden thing totally prohibited.” (٢۵:٢١-٢٢”

:The Qur’anic verses informs about three things

.Meeting Allah is definite and inevitable although the arrogant ones do not want such (۱

Those who deny meeting Allah, say, “Why have not the angels been sent down upon us, (۲
?‘or why do we not see our Lord

p: ۳

.Seeing the angels on the Day of Resurrection is possible (۳

The verses showed that those who did not believe in Allah said: "Can we see our Lord?" So, Allah answered that they can see the angels on the Day of Resurrection. If seeing Allah had been possible, Allah would have granted them such. What will happen on that day is meeting Allah without seeing Him. There are only four Prophetic traditions in the books of the Sunnis apparently proving that Allah will be seen on the Day of Resurrection. .These are traditions narrated by Jarir, Abu Hurayra, Ibn Razin, and Suhayb

These four traditions, besides the weakness of their series of narrators, have been attested to only once (Aahaad) and are not beneficial in arriving at certainty; therefore, .we cannot depend upon them as beliefs. There must be definite evidence

:Allah says

And pursue not that of which you have no knowledge; surely, the hearing and the sight (and the heart, all of these, shall be questioned about that. (۱۷:۳۶

It has been definitively proven that seeing Allah is impossible. Rational and traditional proofs have stood up against the corporeality of Allah and honored Him against such. To meet Allah on the Day of Resurrection means to perceive Him without any means, including the means of sight. A blind man can meet some physical object without seeing it. After that, there are many proofs showing that Allah is not a physical object, because a .physical object is limited in place and time

p: ۴

We have said in our book titled Jami' Baraahin Usul ul-I'tiqadaat (A Collection of Proofs- The Principles of Beliefs) pp. ۶۴-۶۷, that it is impossible for the Necessary Being to be a physical object. We had mentioned many proofs concerning them. Here are some of :them

:The First Proof

A physical object has three dimensions: width, length and depth. It is a combination of parts, and a combination is in need of its parts. That which is in need of its parts in order to .exist is not a Necessary Being

:The Second Proof

:The Second Proof

A physical object is finite and is constantly facing the threat of annihilation from all sides, while the Necessary Being cannot be annihilated at all, and this has been proven in many :ways. The following are some of them

If a physical object has infinite dimensions, we can suppose that there is a point in it from which two lines emanate thus forming an angle, these two lines extending along the expanse of the physical object. If the physical object is infinite, then the two lines will extend to infinity. Because the amount of the separation between the two lines of the angle is the same as the rate of the extension of the two lines, and because the two lines are infinite, the separation between them must also be infinite. This contradicts its being .limited between two lines

Let us suppose that there is a line extended to infinity (line A) and beside it, there is a sphere rotating around its line of axis. One of its poles lies above the infinite line and the other is under it. Before beginning its rotation, let us suppose that there is a line (line B) from the sphere perpendicular to the axis and parallel to the infinite line, extending along with it to infinity. Thus, if the sphere rotates towards the infinite line, the line coming from the sphere (line B) will intersect with the infinite line (line A) point by point. The first point at which the two lines intersect would be the point on the two lines where no intersection had occurred before between them. Hence, it is proved that the first point of intersection .is the last point of the two lines. So, the two lines are finite and cannot be infinite

p: ۵

:Proof of Application

Let us suppose six lines emanating from a point inside the physical object in six directions, extending along with the expanse of the physical object. Then we cut off a section from each line from the side towards the point. Afterwards we apply the section to the point from which the line itself begins before sectioning. It would either extend to infinity, its increase being the same as its decrease and this is impossible, or it would become less by the same amount as the section cut off, and thus it would be finite. The increase in the line itself should be as much as the section only and no more. Thus the finitude of the dimensions of every physical object is proved. The proof can be determined without hypothetical application. If the rest of the line, after cutting off a section is equal to the original line before sectioning, then the part must be equal to the whole. This is impossible. If it is less, it must be finite. Thus the original line, because of its increase, only .does so by the amount of the section alone

:The Third Proof

Every physical object is originated; therefore, it is impossible for the Necessary Being to :be a physical object. This will be made clear by elucidating the following points

It is self evident that a physical object connot be separated from being in motion or at .۱ rest. There is no doubt that a physical object is either at rest in one place or it is in motion .from one place to another

p: ۶

Movement means to be in one place at one moment and to be in another place at the .۲ next moment. Being at rest means to be in a particular place at one moment and to be in the same place at the next moment. Thus, every physical object has two cases: to be in one place in the first moment and, in the second moment, to be in the same place or in .another place

Being in one location at one moment and in the same location or another location at the .۳ next moment are two existential states different from each other, it is possible if one of .them occurs the other will not

Every physical object has a special existence and a particularity by which it is . ۴ distinguished from other physical objects. This particularity is being at a certain time in a certain place. And since the source of all particularity is existence and the particularity of a physical object is by means of its very essence, then all its essential concomitants and particularities have the existence of the physical object as their source. Thus the change of being in a certain place at a certain time necessitates a change of the existence of that .physical object

Being is existence. Thus a change in being is a change of existence. A physical object .۵ always changes. At every moment its existence is different from its existence prior to that moment. Movement and change are in its very existence and not in anything external to its existence. Movement is in the essence and substance of the physical object itself. This .proves that every physical object has substantial motion

p: ۷

Becoming non-existent and becoming existent is the reality of movement i.e. becoming .۶ non-existent at one moment and existent the next moment. Moment by moment, all physical objects become existent and then non-existent, and every existence is preceded .by its non-existence and succeeded by its non-existence

Indeed, if we consider the quiddity of a physical object, movement and being at rest are not included in its quiddity, rather they are external and accidental to it. However, the existence of the physical object and its being is not different to its existence and being in the first moment. Thus it becomes evident that the physical object does not have two existences at the same moment, one of the two being its existence and the second being its existence at that moment. Rather it has but only one single existence. Thus the change in the second moment is the non-existentiating of its existence in the first moment and the existentiating of another existence…and so on in successive moments. This is not inconsistent with the existences of the physical object having a (common) connected form at all successive moments and in terms of this common form, considered to be one physical object. The connected form of movement in the same way requires the .designation of a single motion to this connected form from its beginning to its end

You may say that the Category, when, is one of the nine accidental categories which have two sides, one of which is time, and time is abstracted from the movement of the .heavens

p: ۸

My answer is that time, which is nights, days and their parts, is an abstraction from the movement of the heavens which contains the sun, or from the positional movement of the earth and its revolution around its axis as had been discovered in the last few centuries. However, substantial motion and the essentiality of the physical object have been established through the already mentioned proof. Therefore the relationship of the moments- from which time is composed-, to it (substantial motion) and to the movement of the heavens is the same, whether the heavenly movement is spatial or not.

۷. A physical object is always originated, its origination being renewed at every moment, and that which is originated at every moment is not the same as that which had originated prior to it.

It has been established that it is impossible for a physical object to be the Necessary Being, and it is not necessary for Him, the Most High to be a physical object because nonexistence is impossible for Him. And how could non-existence be possible for Him whilst the existence of all that exists is from Him. He is the Creator of all beings, immaterial and physical, earthly and heavenly, of all places and all times, of those things that stand still and those that move, of all states and of all moments.

The Second Spurious Argument

CONSTRAINT AND FREE WILL

Some people find a problem with the Shias in that they believe neither in constraint nor in free will but that they adopt an interpretation in between and that they refute the Ash'arite concept of constraint.

p: ۹

The answer

The Ash’arites from among the Sunnis, believed in constraint and the Mu’tazilites, also Sunni, believed in free will. The Shias, following their Imams (a), adopted an intermediary position between the two. First of all, we will try to refute constraint and free will by resorting to Qur’anic verses, then we will investigate those traditions that have come from our Imams (a) negating the two of them and establishing the intermediary position .between the two

:Qur’anic Verses that reject constraint are different kinds

The First Kind

The verses that attribute good and bad deeds to the person himself such as the following Suras; al-Isra’ ١۵, Yunus ١٠٨, and az-Zumar ۴١: Whoever goes aright, for his own soul does .he go aright, and whoever goes astray, to its detriment only does he go astray

.(Say if I err, I err only against my own soul. (٣۴:۴٠

.There are a great number of verses in a similar vein

The Second Kind

There are verses that hold the Divine Precinct of Lordship (i.e as Provider and Guide) to be above injustice. For example when Allah says, “Surely Allah does not do injustice to the .weight of an atom.” (۴:۴٠). There are forty such verses

The Third Kind

There are some verses showing that Allah tests His servants whether they choose faith and obedience or choose disbelief and disobedience. Allah says, “Who created death and (life that He may try you, which of you is best in deeds.” (۶٧:٢

.There are nearly sixty-seven verses having this meaning

p: ١٠

The Fourth Kind

There are some verses calling people to faith, guidance, supplication, piety and the like, and that Allah, no doubt, likes people to do these things. He says: "... so that they should (believe in the meeting of their Lord." (٦:١٥٤

that you may warn a people, to whom no warner has come before you, that they may ..." (follow the right direction." (٣٢:٣

and that they may warn their people when they come back to them that they may be..." (cautious." (٩:١٢٢

then We seized them with distress and affliction in order that they might humble..." (themselves." (٦:٤٢

Thus does Allah make clear His communications for men that they may guard against" (evil."(٢:١٨٧

.There are seventy-nine verses conveying such a meaning

The Fifth Kind

There are some verses showing that Allah's reward and punishment are a requital of what people have earned out of their deeds. Allah says, "...then every soul shall be paid (back in full what it has earned, and they shall not be dealt with unjustly." (٢:٢٨١) (٣:١٦١

that every soul may be rewarded for what it has earned and they shall not be"…. (wronged." (٤٥:٢٢

(Every soul is held in pledge for what it earns." (٧٤:٣٨"

(And whoever commits a sin, he only commits it against his own soul." (٤:١١١"

Thus, it is that their recompense is Hell, because they disbelieved and held My" (communications and My apostles in mockery." (١٨:١٠٦

p: ١١

And for those who disbelieved in their Lord is the punishment of Hell, and evil is the" (resort." (۶۷:۶

But as to those who are careful of (their duty to) their Lord, they shall have gardens" (beneath which rivers flow." (۳:۱۹۸

(Their reward with their Lord is gardens of perpetuity beneath which rivers flow." (۹۸:۸"

.There are many other verses with such a meaning in the Holy Qur'an

The Sixth Kind

There are verses that censure and rebuke the disbelievers and the corrupt, and this would not be correct unless they possessed freedom of choice in their actions. Allah says, ("How do you deny Allah and you were dead and He gave you life." (۲:۲۸

But how do you disbelieve while it is you to whom the communications of Allah are" (recited, and among you is His Apostle." (۳:۱۰۱

How, then, will you guard yourselves, if you disbelieve, on the Day which makes children" (gray-headed." (۷۳:۱۷

Why do you disbelieve in the communications of Allah, and Allah is a witness of what you" (do." (۳:۹۸

(Will they still believe in the falsehood and disbelieve in the favor of Allah?" (۲۹:۶۷"

(Were not My communications recited to you but you used to reject them?" (۲۳:۱۰۵"

The Seventh Kind

There are some verses showing that people themselves are responsible for disbelief and ,belief, obedience and disobedience. Allah says

And Musa said 'If you are ungrateful, you and those on Earth all together, most surely," (Allah is Self-Sufficient, Praised." (۱۴:۸

p: ۱۲

and whoever disbelieves in the communications of Allah then surely Allah is quick in..." (reckoning." (٣:١٩

Shall We treat those who believe and do good like the mischief-makers in the earth?"" ((٣٨:٢٨

And he who obeys Allah and His Apostle, and fears Allah, and is careful of (his duty to" (Him), such are those that will achieve." (٢۴:۵٢

(this was because they disobeyed and used to exceed the limit." (۵:٧٨..."

We have mentioned these verses only as examples. Those verses that ascribe actions to .the servant are indeed much more than these

The Eighth Kind

There are verses showing that Allah gives people the option to choose between belief :and disbelief, obedience and disobedience. Allah says

(so let him who pleases believe, and let him who pleases disbelieve." (١٨:٢٩..."

The Ninth Kind

There are verses urging the doing of good before opportunities pass by. Allah says, "And (hasten to forgiveness from your Lord." (٣:١٣٣

The Tenth Kind

There are some verses showing that people should ask for help from Allah. Allah says, ("Thee do we serve and Thee do we beseech for help." (١:۵

This means that man is the performer of his deeds and Allah assists him in his good .actions

The Eleventh Kind

There are some verses that include asking Allah for forgiveness. Allah says, "Our Lord! We have been unjust to ourselves, and if Thou forgive us not, and have (not) mercy on us, we (shall certainly be of the losers." (٧:٢٣

p: ۱۳

The Twelfth Kind

There are some verses which indicate that the confession of the disbelievers on the Day of Resurrection shows that they themselves were responsible for disbelief and disobedience. Allah says, "They said: we were not of those who prayed, and we used not to feed the poor, and we used to enter into discourse with those who entered into vain (discourses." (۷۴:۴۳-۴۵

The Thirteenth Kind

There are verses showing that the disbelievers, on the Day of Resurrection, would wish that they could come back to the life of the world to be pious. Allah says, "...send me back (my Lord, in order that I do good." (۲۳: ۹۹-۱۰۰

Verses that refute free will

Some verses ascribe creational guidance to Allah the Almighty. There is seventy-eight such verses. Allah says, "These are they whom Allah has guided; therefore, follow their (guidance." (۶:۹۰

Such verses show that the source of guidance is Allah, praise be to Him, but there are others showing that man has freedom of choice included in his guidance. Allah says, "... so (let him who pleases believe, and let him who pleases disbelieve." (۱۸:۲۹

Whoever disbelieves, he shall be responsible for his disbelief, and whoever does good," (they prepare (good) for their own souls." (۳۰:۴۴

Allah's being the source of guidance means that He has given man the ability of perception, made the way of guidance and knowledge easy for him, and protected him against the delusions of the devils among jinn and humankind. Were it not for this, man would be a disbeliever and disobedient. Thus, Allah is worthier of man's good deeds than .man himself

p: ۱۴

Man's deviation has originated from the negative application of his free will. Even with the delusions of the Devil and many things else, he still has a free will. Allah has given him the ability of belief and disbelief and the ability of perception, and has made the signs and evidence of guidance and Divine Unity at his disposal and plain for him to see. Allah therefore, does not cause man's deviation, although He, the Almighty, has irresistable power over His servant. Allah says, "If He pleased, He would guide all of Mankind." Allah can force Mankind to accept guidance willingly or unwillingly, but since He has made the way and the means to guidance easy, and has made Man free to choose between guidance and deviation, He has given man a great favor. If he choses deviation and .rejects guidance, then he would stand accused

An example of the aforementioned idea is that of an individual who gave a poor man some money to buy bread, but the latter bought some poison instead, drank it and killed himself. The giver is not to be blamed, for he bestowed a favor upon him in order that he .spend the money in his benefit and not for his destruction

Some Qur'anic verses show that none except Allah possesses power and capability, praise be to Him

He says: "There is no power save in Allah." (۱۸:۳۹) There is no contradiction at all between this meaning and man's freedom of choice and power to do whatever he likes, because in the face of the Divine power and Lordship he is completely impotent, having no authority over good or bad for himself. Taking into consideration that Allah has given man power and ability, man's very power is a manifestation of Allah's power, thus eliminating the inconsistency between the establishment of power in man and the meaning of His words when The Most High says, "There is no power save in Allah." A very large number of verses attest to this meaning. Allah says, " ... so let him who pleases believe, and let him (who pleases disbelieve." (۱۸:۲۹

p: ۱۵

Whoever disbelieves, he shall be responsible for his disbelief, and whoever does good,"
(prepare (good) for their own souls. (۳۰:۴۴

and whoever is grateful, he is grateful only for his own soul, and whoever is ungrateful, ..."
(then surely my Lord is Self-Sufficient, Honored." (۲۷:۴۰

Some verses show that benefit and harm are in the hands of Allah exclusively. Allah says,
("Say: I do not control any benefit or harm for my own soul except as Allah pleases." (۷:۱۸۸

(so let him who pleases believe, and let him who pleases disbelieve." (۱۸:۲۹ ..."

(and had your Lord pleased they would not have done it." (۶:۱۱۲ ..."

(and if Allah had pleased, they would not have done it." (۶:۱۳۷ ..."

From these verses, we notice that Allah has given man the ability to believe if he wants, or to disbelieve if he wants. If Allah wants to prevent man from that freedom of choice, He will deprive him of ability and make him unable to do what he wants. Later on, we will .prove that this is one aspect of the Shias' concept of intermediacy

Shias' interpretation of the Conception of intermediacy

Despite their variety, the two groups of Qur'anic verses mentioned above show that man's actions have two aspects. One aspect concerns man himself, in that he has the option and the will to do whatever he wants. This is clear from the many Qur'anic verses that show that man is responsible for his deeds. The other aspect concerns Allah. The verses that ascribe guidance and deviation to Allah are numerous and clear, however, the manner in which these two aspects relate to each other, as has been gathered from the :Qur'anic text, is based upon one of three opinions

p: ۱۶

First: Man's existence, and all his actions, whether from his body or his soul, has its source in the Creator, Exalted and Elevated is His Might. He has given man the ability to do good or bad and to choose the good that takes him to the elevated stations of the Highest Ones .whose ranks cannot be attained without freedom of will

Thus, if man is the cause of his actions, and Allah is the cause of man's existence, his .abilities, and his will to do or not to do, then Allah is a remote cause of man's actions

Second: The power of the Maker encompasses the actions of man. Thus If He wants to prevent man from choosing certain actions or to let him act in other ways He can, He (says, "If He pleased, He would guide you all." (۶:۱۴۹

Allah has created people to try them. He (Elevated is His Might) says, "Who created death and life that He may try you, which of you is best in deeds." (۶۷:۲) Thus He does not prevent them from exercising their choice in thinking and belief, rather, He has placed it within the sphere of their will

(He says: "... so let him who pleases believe, and let him who pleases disbelieve." (۱۸:۲۹

In short, the actions of man are related to Allah in so far as there is no prevention or .opposition to what man chooses to do

Third: Lusts and instincts that mislead and delude man are from Allah (Exalted is He). Allah .has given man the ability to do good or bad deeds so as to try him in this worldly life

p: ۱۷

Since lusts and instincts are from Allah, deviating is from Allah, despite the fact that man goes astray willingly and of his own free volition. What Allah says about the idols in the story of Prophet Ibrahim (a) confirms this although Allah does not want people to deviate. He (Exalted is He) says, "My Lord! Surely, they have led many men astray." (١۴:٣۶) The people deviated on their own. The idols were just sculptures having no sense and they .could not lead people astray, for they had no will

In summary, the conditions for the actions of man are a part of the sufficient cause of his .(actions, which is from Allah (Exalted is He

Another proof confirming the Shia concept of intermediacy between constraint and free will is when Allah says, "… and you did not smite when you smote (the enemy), but it was (Allah Who smote." (٨:١٧

This verse clearly ascribes the smiting to man himself for Allah says, "when you smote," at the same time it includes the opposite for Allah also says "and you did not smite" this .negates the ascription of the act to man thus proving the concept of intermediacy

The Third Spurious Argument

VISITING THE SHRINES OF THE PROPHETS, IMAMS AND SAINTS

Some people accuse the Shias of believing that it is permissible to visit the shrines of the Prophets, Imams and saints, building them, to seek blessings through them, to pray and make supplications around them whereas it is prohibited to consider tombs as mosques .or to build mosques upon tombs

p: ١٨

The answer

There is no prohibition on visiting tombs in any of the traditions, rather the Wahhabis prohibited it. We have discussed this matter in our book Al-Jami' li Baraahin Usul ul-I'tiqadaat. We hereby, refer to the same discussion that is recorded on pages ۴۱۳-۴۱۶ of :that book

The Wahhabis prohibited setting out to visit the tomb of the Prophet (s) to say nothing of" the graves of others as well. Al-Qastalani, in his book Sharh Sahih ul-Bukhari, and Ibn Hajar, in his book al-Jawhar ul-Munazzam, recorded that Ibn Taymiyyah, a model for the Wahhabis, prohibited visiting the Prophet's shrine. Mulla Ali al-Qari says in his book :Sharhu sh-Shafa, vol. ۲

Ibn Taymiyyah the Hanbalite was extreme when he prohibited setting out to visit the" tomb of the Prophet (s). Others were even more extreme when they said that visiting is definitely a pious act in religion, and denying this is condemned as infidelity. Perhaps the second point was nearer to being correct, because (of the rule that says) prohibiting that which, according to the consensus of the ulama, is considered as recommended (mustahhab) is considered as unbelief, for here prohibition supercedes something that ".was permissible by unanimous agreement in this case

Proving the legitimacy of visiting the Prophet's shrine

There are four evidences showing the legitimacy and the merits of visiting the tomb of :the Prophet (s), as it is recorded in the book titled Kashf ul-Irtiyab p. ۳۶۲-۳۷۲

The First Evidence

.The first evidence is found in the Holy Qur'an

p: ۱۹

:Allah says

And had they, when they were unjust to themselves, come to you and asked forgiveness" of Allah and the Apostle had (also) asked forgiveness for them, they would have found (Allah Oft-Returning (to mercy), Merciful." (۴:۶۴

:As-Samhudi, in his Wafa'ul-Wafa' vol. ۲ p. ۴۱۱, records

The ulama understood from this Qur'anic verse that it applied in general to the two cases" of life and death. They ruled that it is recommendable for everyone who visits the tomb ".(of the Prophet) to recite that verse

The Second Evidence

The second evidence is the Sunna. There are many prophetic traditions in this regard. They are mentioned by as-Samhudi in his book Wafa'ul-Wafa' vol. ۴ p. ۳۹۴-۴۰۳, as well as by many others. We will hereunder report some of them as recorded by as-Samhudi and omit other narrators upon the subject. At any rate, as-Samhudi has made sufficient .reference to such narrators

Ad-Darqutni —in his book as-Sunan and other books—, al-Bayhaqi, and others (۱ mentioned a certified Prophetic tradition narrated by Musa bin Hilal al-Abdi, from Ubaydullah bin Umar, from Nafi', from Ibn Umar that the Prophet Muhammad (peace be ".upon him -and his family-) said: "He who visits my tomb deserves my intercession

Al-Bazzar narrated from Abdullah bin Ibrahim al-Ghifari, from Abdur-Rahman bin Zayd, (۲ from his father, from Ibn Umar that Prophet Muhammad (peace be upon him -and his ".family-) said: "He who visits my tomb deserves my intercession

At-Tabarani in his books (al-Mu'jam) al-Kabir and al-Awsat, ad-Darqutni in his book al- (۳ Amali, and Abu Bakr bin al-Muqri in his Mu'jam mention a tradition narrated by Maslama bin Salim al-Juhani, from Ubaydullah bin Umar, from Nafi', from Salim, from Ibn Umar that the Prophet Muhammad (peace be upon him -and his family-) said, "He who comes to visit me, having no other desire than that of visiting me, of a surety I will be an ".intercessor for him on the Day of Judgement

He commented: “It was mentioned in ibn ul-Muqri’s Mu’jam, “For him who comes to visit me, it will be incumbent upon Allah to make me an intercessor for him on the Day of ”.Resurrection

He also commented that ibn us-Sakan mentioned this prophetic saying in his book as-Sunan as-Sihah under the subject of Allah’s reward for visiting the Prophet’s shrine. He said that this Prophetic saying was unanimously confirmed to be right by the ulama. This .tradition includes, in general, visiting the Prophet during his life and after his death

Ad-Darqutni and at-Tabarani in his books al-Kabir and al-Awsat mention a tradition (۴ narrated by Hafs bin Dawud al-Qari, from Layth, from Mujahid, from Ibn Umar that the Prophet Muhammad (s) said: “He who goes on pilgrimage to Mecca and visits my tomb ”.after my death will be regarded the same as those who had visited me during my life

He commented, “Ibn Al-Jawzi related this tradition in his book Muthir ul-Gharam us-Sakin according to the same chain of narrations, but he added to the tradition, ‘…and accompanied me.’ The same tradition was also mentioned by ibn Adiy in his book al-Kamil with the same series and addition, and by Abu Ya’la with the same series, but without the addition. In some narratives, the hadith was related in the following way: He who goes on pilgrimage and visits me will be regarded the same as those who had visited me during my life.. At-Tabarani mentions this tradition in his books al-Kabir and al-Awsat narrated by ‘Aa’isha bint Yunus —Layth’s wife—, from Layth bin Abu Sulaym, from Mujahid, from Ibn Umar that the Prophet Muhammad (peace be upon him -and his family-) said, “He ”.who visits my tomb after my death is as if he had visited me during my life

p: ۲۱

COMMENTARY: As-Suyuti, in his book al-Jami'us-Saghir, mentions the hadith in the same manner as the first narration, from Ahmad in his Musnad, Abu Dawud, at-Tirmidhi and .an-Nassa'i, from al-Harith

Ibn Adiy mentions in his book al-Kamil a tradition narrated by Muhammad bin (۵ Muhammad bin an-Nu'man, from his grandfather, from Malik, from Nafi', from Ibn Umar that Prophet Muhammad (peace be upon him -and his family-) said, "He who visits the Holy Kaaba but does not visit me is turning away from me." As-Sabki said: "Ibnu-Jawzi ".mentions, in al-Mawzu'at, something like that

Ad-Darqutni, in his book as-Sunan, mentions a tradition narrated by Musa bin Harun, (۶ from Muhammad bin al-Hasan al-Jili, from Abdur-Rahman bin al-Mubarak, from Awn bin Musa, from Ayyub, from Nafi', from Ibn Umar that the Prophet (s) said: "For him who visits ".me in Medina, I will be a witness and an intercessor for him on the Day of Judgment

Abu Dawud at-Tayalissi mentions a tradition narrated by Siwar bin Maymun abul- (۷ Jarrah al-Abdi from a man of Umar's family that Umar said: "I heard the Prophet (a) saying: For him who visits my tomb —or visits me—, I will be an intercessor and a witness ".for him

Abu Ja'far al-Aqili mentions a tradition narrated by Siwar bin Maymun, from a man of (٨ the family of al-Khattab that the prophet (peace be upon him -and his family-) said: "He ".who visits me intentionally will be my neighbor on the Day of Resurrection

p: ٢٢

۹) Ad-Darqutni and others mention a tradition narrated by Harun bin Qaz'a, from a man of Hatib's family, from Hatib that the Prophet (peace be upon him -and his family-) said: "He who visits me after my death is as if he had visited me during my life."

۱۰) Abul-Fat'h al-Azdi mentions a tradition narrated by Ammar bin Muhammad, from his uncle Sufyan, from Mansur, from Ibrahim, from Alqama, from Abdullah that the Prophet Muhammad (peace be upon him -and his family-) said: "He who performs the hajj, visits my tomb, participates in Jihad, and prays in Jerusalem, will not be asked by Allah about his religious duties on the Day of Judgment."

۱۱) Abul-Futuh mentions a tradition with his own series of narrators, narrated by Khalid bin Yazid, from Abdullah bin Umar al-Umari, from Sa'id al Maqbari, from Abu Hurayra that the Prophet (peace be upon him -and his family-) said: "He who visits me after my death is as if he had visited me when I was alive, and whoever visits me I will be a witness and an intercessor for him on the Day of Judgment."

۱۲) Ibn Abu-Dunya mentions a tradition narrated by Isma'il bin Abu Fudayk, from Sulayman bin Yazid al-Ka'bi, from Anas bin Malik that the Prophet (peace be upon him -and his family-) said: "For him who visits me in Medina, I will be a witness and —, according to another tradition— an intercessor for him on the Day of Resurrection." The same was mentioned by al-Bayhaqi with the same series of narrators, but in other words: "He who sets out to Medina to visit me will be my neighbor on the Day of Resurrection."

p: ۲۳

Ibnu-Najjar in his book Akhbar ul-Medina mentioned a hadith related to Anas that (١٣ Prophet Muhammad (peace be upon him -and his family-) said: "He who visits me after my death will be as if he had visited me when I was alive, and whoever visits my tomb will ".deserve my intercession

Abu Ja'far al-Aqili mentioned a hadith related to ibn Abbas that the Prophet (peace be (١۴ upon him -and his family-) said: "He who visits me after my death will be as if he had visited me in my life, and for him who visits me until he reaches my tomb, I will be a ".witness (or he said: an intercessor) for him on the Day of Resurrection

Some muhadditheen in the time of Ibn Mundah mentioned a tradition narrated by ibn (١۵ Abbas that the Prophet (peace be upon him -and his family-) said: "He who goes on pilgrimage to Mecca and goes to visit me in my mosque will be granted (the reward of) two admitted pilgrimages." He commented: This tradition is recorded in Musnad ul-.Firdaus

Yahya bin al-Hasan bin Ja'far al-Husayni —in Akhbar ul-Madina— mentions a hadith (١۶ narrated by Imam Ali (a) that the Prophet Muhammad (s) said: "He who visits my tomb after my death will be as if he had visited me in my life, and whoever does not visit me is turning away from me." Ibn Asaakir mentioned a hadith narrated by Imam Ali (a) saying, "He who visits a prophet's tomb will be in the neighborhood of the Prophet Mohammad ".((s

p: ٢۴

Yahya, too, narrated by someone, from Bakr bin Abdullah that the Prophet (peace be (۱۷ upon him -and his family-) said: "He who comes to Medina visiting me will deserve my ".intercession on the Day of Resurrection

These were the prophetic traditions that as-Samhudi has mentioned. Although they are quite numerous, they confirm each other. They are also confirmed by the other hadiths that will be mentioned although we do not need them for proving our claim, the definitive .conduct and the actions of Muslims proves this to the level of its necessity

The Third Evidence

The third evidence is consensus. Since the time of the Prophet (s) and his Companions, Muslims, in their words and actions have been unanimous upon visiting the Prophet's tomb and no one has departed from this way except the Wahhabis. In fact, visiting the graves of the prophets, pious men and those of all Muslims is a recommended act. All the Believers, the legitimacy of the act, as well as consensus have made this tradition a necessary one among the Muslims. The Muslims have continued with this practice from the time of the Prophet Muhammad (s), down to that of his Companions, then to the time of their disciples, and to their followers, as well as to all the Muslims in every age and every clime, learned or ignorant, young or old, men or women. To deny this is only to .enter into a conflict with that which is self- evident and to deny the inevitable

p: ۲۵

As-Samhudi quoted in his book Wafa'ul-Wafa', from as-Sabki that Ayyadh said: "Visiting the Prophet's tomb is a tradition among Muslims and a recommended virtue."

As-Sabki said: "All of the ulama have agreed upon the recommendation for men to visit the graves. The Zahirites have also said that it was obligatory. But they have had different opinions concerning women visiting the graves. The holy Prophet's shrine has been distinguished (from other graves) for special reasons, so I would say that there would be no difference between men and women in this regard."

The Fourth Evidence

The fourth evidence is the intellect. The intellect decides that the glorifying of those whom Allah has glorified is something to be preferred. Visiting the shrine of the Prophet (s) is a glorification of such a kind. The glorifying of the Prophet, by means of visiting his tomb or by any other means, is the glorification of the Islamic rites and the defeat of the enemies of Islam.

As for visiting other people's tombs, it was proved that the Prophet Muhammad (s) used to visit the graveyard of al-Baqi' and the martyrs of (the battle of) Uhud. Ibn Maja mentioned a prophetic tradition saying: "Visit the graveyards because they remind you of the Afterlife." He mentioned another relation, narrated by 'Aa'isha, that Prophet Muhammad (s) had said: "I had forbidden you to visit the graves, but henceforth visit them, because they make you turn away from this life and remind you of the Afterlife." The same narration was related by Muslim who also recorded it up to the Prophet's saying, (visit them.) An-Nasa'i mentioned a prophetic tradition saying: "I had forbidden you to visit the graves but now whoever wants to visit them let him do so." In as-Sindi's Al-Hashiya, it is mentioned that this tradition was narrated by reliable people –according to the reference book of Az-Zawa'id-.

p: ۲۶

The Prophet Muhammad (s) visited his mother's grave although opponents have claimed that she was a polytheist. Muslim, Ibn Maja and an-Nassa'i mentioned a prophetic saying narrated by Abu Hurayra that the Prophet (s) visited his mother's tomb, wept, and caused all those who were around him to weep. He then said, "I asked my Allah to permit me seek His forgiveness for my mother, but He did not permit me. I asked Him to permit me to visit her tomb and He permitted. So, you visit the graves for they remind you of death. ".An-Nawawi, in his book titled Sharh Sahih il-Bukhari, said: "It is a true Hadith, no doubt

Muslim mentioned that whenever the turn of 'Aa'isha came —for the Prophet (s) to spend that night with her—, he used to go out at the end of night to the cemetry of al-Baqi' and say: "Peace be upon you, the inhabitants of this house of believers. May Allah grant you what He has promised." He (s) taught 'Aa'isha what to say after she had asked him what to say. He (s) said: "Say: Peace be upon the people of the abodes; believers and .Muslims)."Muslim has recorded this hadith

Although we believe that all the forebears of the Prophet were believers according to the true Hadiths and we do not accept the claim that the Prophet's mother was a polytheist, we have quoted this Hadith to raise an objection to those who forbid the visiting of .graves

The Fourth Spurious Argument

THE INTERCESSION OF THE PROPHETS, IMAMS AND SAINTS

p: ۲۷

Some people find fault with the Shias claiming that they believe in the intercession of the Prophet, the Imams and Saints and that they ask them to be intercessors for them with .Allah on the Day of Judgment

The answer

Evidence for the validity of intercession is found in the Holy Qur'an. We have talked about .this topic in detail in our book titled al-Jami' li Barahin Usul ul-I'tiqadaat p. ۴۱۹-۴۲۲

:Intercession, according to the Holy Qur'an, is of two types

The First Type

The first type is intercession without Allah. It is an intercession to other than Himself that Allah (Blessed and Exalted is He) denies. Allah says, "There is no guardian for them or any (intercessor besides Him." (۶:۵۱

.There are other verses having the same meaning

Generally, intercession depends upon the power over conveying the needs of the person requesting the intercession and the obligation of the one interceded to fulfil this need even if he is not pleased with it. Such intercession cannot be for other than Allah (Exalted is He). Allah says: "Say: Allah's is the intercession altogether. His is the kingdom of the (heavens and the earth." (۳۹:۴۴

Believing in the intercession of any other save Allah in this respect is a form of polytheism. The idolaters worshipped idols in order to obtain such an intercession, as testified to in .the Holy Qur'an

The Second Type

The second type is intercession with Allah's permission. Allah has made this type of intercession an exception from that intercession that he has denied and has granted it to .whomever He has willed

p: ۲۸

:Allah says

(Who is he that can intercede with Him but by His permission?" (۲:۲۵۵"

Whose intercession does not avail at all except after Allah has given permission to" (whomsoever He pleases and chooses." (۵۳:۲۶

(and they do not intercede except for him whom He approves." (۲۱:۲۸..."

This type of intercession consists of simply asking Allah on behalf of him who is to be .interceded for

Another kind of intercession is asking Allah to forgive others. Allah has permitted his .Prophet Muhammad (s) to ask Him for forgivness for believing men and believing women

:Allah says

(and ask pardon for them, and take counsel with them in the affair." (۳:۱۵۹"...

(and ask forgiveness for them from Allah." (۲۴:۶۲"...

(and ask forgiveness for them (women) from Allah." (۶۰:۱۲"...

Allah has promised to forgive whoever asks Him for forgiveness and beseeches the .Prophet (s) to intercede for him

He, The Almighty says: "And had they, when they were unjust to themselves, come to you and asked forgiveness of Allah and the Apostle had (also) asked forgiveness for them, (they would have found Allah Oft…Returning (to mercy), Merciful." (۴:۶۴

.Allah has mentioned that the angels ask Him to forgive the believers

He says: "... Celebrate the praise of their Lord and believe in Him and ask protection for those who believe... grant protection to those who turn (to Thee) and follow Thy way, and (save them from the punishment of Hell." (۴۰:۷

p: ۲۹

Allah has also mentioned the prayer of the prophet Noah and his asking Allah to forgive the believers: "My Lord! Forgive me and my parents and him who enters my house believing, and the believing men and the believing women." (۷۱:۲۸)

He has also spoken about the prophet Ibrahim's prayer and his asking Allah to forgive the believers.

He says: "O our Lord! Grant me protection and my parents and the believers on the Day when the reckoning shall come to pass!" (۱۴:۴۱)

Allah has taught the believers how to ask Him for forgiveness: "Our Lord! Surely, we believe, therefore forgive us our faults and save us from the chastisement of the Fire." ((۳:۱۶)

"Our Lord! Forgive us our faults and our extravagance in our affair." (۳:۱۴۷ and other verses)

Allah has forbidden asking Him to forgive the polytheists.

He says: "It is not (fit) for the Prophet and those who believe that they should ask forgiveness for the polytheists, even though they should be near relatives, after it has become clear to them that they are inmates of the flaming Fire. And Ibrahim asking forgiveness for his sire was only owing to a promise, which he had made to him; but when it became clear to him that he was an enemy of Allah, he declared himself to be clear of him." (۹:۱۱۳-۱۱۴)

Allah, likewise, has forbidden asking Him to forgive the disbelievers and confirmed He will not accept it.

He says: "It is alike to them whether you beg forgiveness for them or do not beg forgiveness for them, Allah will never forgive them." (۶۳:۶)

p: ۳۰

The Fifth Spurious Argument

BESEECHING THE PROPHETS, IMAMS AND SAINTS

Some people criticize the Shias of beseeching the Prophets, Imams and virtuous Saints, and of adjuring Allah through them believing that it has an effect upon their supplications .being answered

The answer

The prohibition of beseeching the Prophet Muhammad (s), the other prophets, the :Imams, and the Saints is another Wahhabi innovation. Allah says

O you who believe! Be careful of (your duty to) Allah and seek means of nearness to" (Him." (۵:۳۵

:As-Samhudi said, in his book Wafa'ul-Wafa',chapter Akhbar ul-Mustafa

Beseeching the Prophet (s) for something may mean that he (s) can intercede with Allah" to achieve what has been asked for. It is just as when someone asks him to be his ."Companion in Paradise. It means that the Prophet is a cause and an intercessor

In Kashf ul-Irtiyab p.۲۵۲, it is recorded that an-Nassa'i, at-Tirmidhi and others mentioned :that Prophet Muhammad (s) had taught some of his Companions to pray by saying

O' My Lord. I ask You and beseech You by the honor of Your Apostle, the Apostle of Mercy. O' Muhammad, the Apostle of Allah, I beseech you to intercede with Allah to grant .me what I ask for. O' Allah, accept his intercession

As-Samhudi quoted in his book Wafa'ul-Wafa' vol. ۲ p. ۴۲۲, from the judge Ayyadh's book :ash-Shafa' that Abu Hamid said

Abu Ja'far, the Caliph, debated with Malik bin Anas in the mosque of the Prophet" Muhammad (s). Malik said: "O' Amir ul-Mu'minin -Commander of the Believers-, do not talk aloud in this mosque, because Allah had educated the people by saying: "O you who believe! Do not raise your voices above the voice of the Prophet, and do not speak loud to him as you speak loud to one another, lest your deeds became nullified while you do not (perceive." (۴۹:۲

p: ۳۱

He has praised some people by saying: "Surely, they who lower their voices before Allah's Apostle are they whose hearts Allah has proved for guarding against evil, they shall have (forgiveness and a great reward." (۴۹:۳

He has dispraised some people by saying: "As for those who call out to you from behind (the private chambers, surely most of them do not understand." (۴۹:۴

".The Prophet (s) enjoys the same sanctity whether he is alive or dead

Abu Ja'far submitted and said: "O' Abu Abdullah, may I face the Qiblah to pray or should I face the (shrine of the) Prophet?" Malik answered, "Why do you turn your face away from him when he is your intermediary and your father Adam's intermediary to Allah on the Day of Judgment? Turn your face towards him and ask him to be your intercessor with Allah. Allah (Exalted is He) says, 'And had they, when they were unjust to themselves, come to you and asked forgiveness of Allah and the Apostle had also asked forgiveness (for them, they would have found Allah Oft-returning to mercy, Merciful.' (۴:۶۴

The author of Khulasat ul-Kalam says that this tradition was mentioned by as-Sabki in his book Shifa'us-Siqam fi Ziyarat Khayr ul-Anam, as-Samhudi in his book Khulasat ul-Wafa, al-Qastalani in his book al-Mawahib al-Laduniyya, Ibn Hajar in his books Tuhfatuz-Zuwwar and al-Jawhar ul-Munazzam and many others who wrote about the etiquette of .(visiting the tomb of Prophet Muhammad (s

Ibn Hajar said in his book al-Jawharul-Munazzam: "This tradition, narrated by Imam ".Malik, came with a true source that could not be suspected

p: ۳۲

Az-Zarqani said in Sharh ul-Mawahib: “The relation was narrated by Ibn Fahad from an affirmed source and by the Judge Ayyadh in his book ash-Shafa from a true source. All the narrators of this relation were reliable and no one was an inventor or liar.” He added: “He wanted to refute those who charged Malik that he disliked facing the Prophet’s “.tomb

Ibn Hajar in his book as-Sawa’iq ul-Muhriqa said that Imam ash-Shafi’i beseeched the :Prophet’s family when he composed the lines

The Prophet’s family is my excuse

And my means to gain Allah’s content

(I hope that tomorrow (Day of Judgment

I will be given my book with my right hand

By means of their honor near Allah

;The author of Kashf ul-Irtiyab on page ۲۶۰ of the book has added

However, the supplications transmitted from the Imams of the pure Household of the” Prophet which have the status of being uninterrupted transmissions (tawatur) are replete with them beseeching their grandfather (s), his pure family, through his right and theirs, and through this adjuring the Most High. They knew more about their grandfather’s traditions and the laws of their Lord than Ibn Taymiyyah and Ibn Abdul-Wahhab and their followers from among the Arabs of Najd. This is because they were the gate of the city of knowledge of Muhammad (s) and the inheritors of his knowledge from whom he ordered “.us to learn

:On page ۲۶۰, he recorded

A kind of beseeching the Prophet (s) is to turn towards his honored tomb while praying.” This was common in the tradition of the Muslims for centuries, and for generations. Imam Malik had issued his fatwa about this matter and recommended it in his saying to al-Mansur, ‘Why do you turn your face away from him when he is your means and your father Adam’s means to Allah? You should turn your face towards him and ask him to be

".your intercessor'"

p: ۳۳

:The author of Khulasat ul-Kalam said

The scholars of the Islamic rites said that turning the face towards the Prophet's" honored tomb while visiting and praying is better than to turn it towards the Qiblah."

:Ibn Hajar said in al-Jawharul-Munazzam

What leads us to turn towards the Prophet's tomb is that we all agree that the Prophet" Muhammad (s) is alive in his tomb and he knows his visitors. If he (s) is alive, one cannot but turn the face towards him and turn his back to the Qiblah, therefore, it is the same to visit him in his tomb."

.He then quoted Malik's saying to al-Mansur, which is mentioned above

He then said: "Az-Zarqani said in his book Sharh ul-Mawahib that the books of the Malikis are full of traditions recommending praying near the tomb (of the Prophet) facing it and turning the back to the Qiblah. He quoted from the doctrine of Abu Hanifa and that of ash-Shafi'i's and from the generality of the schools of thought in Islam something similar. Then he said: Imam Ahmad is different from the others, but the scholars think that he turned towards the holy tomb like anybody else."

On page ٢٥٨, he said: "As-Samhudi said: Many scholars within the four schools have mentioned in their books of Islamic rites concerning visiting the Prophet (s). It was recommended for visitors to turn their faces towards the honored tomb beseeching Allah to forgive them and to grant them what they ask for and to make the Prophet their intercessor."

p: ٣۴

On page ۲۶۳ he said: "Abu Hanifa mentioned in his Musnad that Ibn Umar said, 'It is recommended that when you visit the Prophet's tomb, you turn your back to the Qiblah facing the tomb and you greet him.' Ibn Jama'a mentions in his book al-Mansak ul-Kabir, 'The sect of Abu Hanifa'... until he said... 'he turns until he stands towards the holy face "with his back to the Qiblah and gives his greeting

The Sixth Spurious Argument

INHERITING FROM THE PROPHETS

The Shias are suspected of believing that the prophets bequeath what they possess to their inheritors like the rest of Muslims and they believe that the tradition which was narrated by Abu Bakr, when He said: "We, the prophets, do not bequeath. What we have .left is to be considered as charity" is untrue

The answer

The Shias believe that the Prophets may bequeath what they possess to their inheritors just like other people. The Holy Qur'an has confirmed this when Allah says, "Solomon was (David's heir." (۲۷:۱۶

—,Zachariah prayed to Allah saying —as Allah mentions in the Holy Qur'an

And surely I fear my cousins after me, and my wife is barren, therefore grant me from" Thyself an heir, who would inherit from me and inherit from the children of Jacob, and make him, my Lord, one in whom thou art well pleased. O Zachariah! Surely, We give you good news of a boy whose name shall be Yahya: We have not made before his equal."

((۱۹:۵-۷

p: ۳۵

It is agreed upon by all Muslims that this tradition (We, Prophets, do not devise...) was narrated by Abu Bakr only. It also runs contrary to the Holy Qur'an and has no support. It therefore cannot repeal the Holy Qur'an especially since afterwards it has been refuted by the Prophet's family and denounced as untrue by Fatima az-Zahraa (peace be upon her), the Chief of the Women of all the Worlds, based upon irrefutable textual evidence attested to by all. She silenced the Caliph Abu Bakr when she reasoned that it would have been incomprehensible for the Prophet to have informed Abu Bakr alone about this and not inform his heirs. But how surprising it is that there are those who try to bring down the Holy Qur'an down to their level, abrogating its verses because of a narration by one Companion singled out for the purpose in spite of the fact that the purified family of the !Prophet has denied that tradition and considered it as untrue

The Seventh Spurious Argument

THE FABRICATION THAT THE SHIAS BELIEVE THE PROPHETIC MISSION BELONGED TO IMAM ALI

There is a widespread spurious argument that the Shias believe that -Allah forbid- the prophecy had been intended for Imam Ali, and the Archangel Gabriel (a) had given it to the Prophet Muhammad (s) by mistake! They also fabricate a lie that the Shias say after their daily prayers, "The loyal (Gabriel) had betrayed, (khanal ameen)" three times raising .their hands in disapproval

The answer

This is a great slander against the Shias and an insult to the Keeper of Divine Revelation, Allah the Most High. It was a fabrication attributed to the Shia for it is not possible for a Muslim to say such a thing. Perhaps it had appeared among some of the extremists in .religion whom the Shia have ruled to be unbelievers

p: ۳۶

The truth of the matter is that the Shia say Allahu Akbar (Allah is greater) three times after their prayers raising their hands when they say it. This is established in their books. They believe that the best recital after prayers is to say Allahu Akbar three times then to recite what Fatima (a) recited after her prayers, which is to glorify Allah one hundred times; saying Allahu Akbar thirty four times, Subhan Allah (Glory be to Allah) thirty-three .times and saying al Hamdu lillah (Praise be to Allah) thirty-three times

The Eighth Spurious Argument

THE TRADITIONS THAT THE PROPHET APPOINTED IMAM ALI AS GUARDIAN AND SUCCESSOR

The Shias are criticized for saying that the Prophet Muhammad (s) had recommended that the Imamate and the caliphate were for Ali and his sons (a), and that the Prophet's .Companions had opposed his testament

The answer

Among both Shias and Sunnis it has been established that the Prophet (s) had appointed Ali to be the Caliph and Imam after him. At the Well of Khum (Ghadir Khum), he proclaimed Ali to be his successor in the presence of groups of Muslims coming back from his last Hajj.He made sure that every one heard this in spite of the big crowds on that day. The news had reached everyone and everywhere. The chain of transmission of the news .of Ghadir Khum in Sunni books has been uninterrupted and certain

We have collected ۲۵۶ sources of the tradition of al Ghadir from the books of our Sunni brothers in our book al-Jami' li Barahin Usulul-I'tiqadaat. We had adequately explained that the tradition clearly meant to appoint Ali as leader and Imam after the Prophet (s). :Here we quote it in brief

p: ۳۷

Ibn Asaakir said in his book The History of Damascus vol. p.۴۵: Abu Bakr Muhammad bin al-Husayn bin al-Marziqi told us that abul-Husayn Muhammad bin Ali bin al- Muhtadi told us that abul-Hasan Ali bin Umar bin Muhammad bin al-Hasan told us that al-Abbas bin Ahmad told us that Nasr bin Abdur-Rahman abu Sulayman al-Washa' told us that Zayd bin al-Hasan al-Anmati told us that Ma'roof bin Kharbooth al-Makki told us that he had heard from Abut-Tufayl Aamir bin Wathila that Hudhayfa bin Useid said, "When Prophet Muhammad (s) had come back from his last hajj (farewell hajj), he ordered his Companions to stop at some trees which were near each another in the desert. He came ,and did his prayer under the trees. Then he stood up and said

O people, Allah the Most Kind the Omniscient has told me that no apostle lives to more' than half the age of him who had preceded him. I think I am about to be called (die) and thus I must respond. I am responsible and you are responsible, then what do you say?' They said, 'We witness that you have informed, advised and striven. May Allah bless you.' He said, 'Do you not bear witness that there is no god but Allah and that Muhammad is His servant and Apostle, and that His Heaven is true, His Hell is true, death is true, the Resurrection after death is true, that there is no doubt that the Day of Judgment will come, and that Allah will resurrect the dead from their graves?' They said, 'Yes, we bear witness'. He said, 'O Allah, bear witness.' Then he said, 'O people, Allah is my Lord and I am the lord of the believers. I am worthier of believers than themselves. Of whomsoever I had been Gurdian, Ali here is to be his Guardian. O Allah, be a supporter of whoever supports him (Ali) and an enemy of whoever opposes him.' Then he said, 'O people, I will go ahead of you and you will arrive at my Pond (in Heaven) which is wider than the distance between Basra and San'a. It has receptacles as numerous as the stars, and two cups of gold and two of silver. I will ask you about the two weighty things that I have left for you when you come to me to see how you dealt with them. The greater weighty thing is Allah's book—the Holy Qur'an. One end is in Allah's hand and the other is in your hands. Keep it and you will not deviate. That other weighty thing is my family and my descendents. The Most Kind the Omniscient had told me that both of them, would not ".separate until they come to my Pond

The aforementioned account has been a summary of the tradition. We will now cite some of its sources along with the names of the Companions who had heard it from the Prophet (s), as quoted from the books of our Sunni brothers. After omitting names that have been :repeated the following is what we have gathered from their books

Narrated by Zathan, from thirteen persons, mentioned in (Ahmad's book Musnad) vol. ۱ (۱ .p. ۸۴

Ziyad bin Abu Ziyad, from twelve persons, who had fought in the battle of Badr. (۲ .(Ahmad's Musnad) vol. ۱ p. ۸۸

Sa'id bin Wahhab, from five or six persons (an-Nassa'i's book al-Khasa'is), p. ۲۱ and (۳ .Ahmad's Musnad vol. ۵ p. ۳۶۶

.Sa'id bin Wahhab, from six persons – Al-Khasa'is p. ۲۶ and ۴۰ (۴

.Sa'id bin Wahhab, from six persons in The History of Damascus, vol. ۲ p. ۲۸ (۵

.Sa'id bin Wahhab, from thirteen persons-Majma'uz-Zawayid, vol. ۹ (۶

.Sa'id bin Wahhab and Zayd bin Yathigh, from twelve persons- Musnad, vol. ۱ p. ۱۱۸ (۷

.Sa'id bin Wahhab and Zayd bin Yathigh, from some persons- Kifayat at-Talib, p. ۱۸ (۸

.Zayd bin Yathigh, from six persons- Al-Khasa'is, p. ۲۶ (۹

Amr Dhi Mur, Sa'id bin Wahhab and Zayd bin Yathigh, from thirteen persons-The (۱۰ .History of Damascus, vol. ۲ p. ۱۸

Amr Dhi Mur and Sa'id bin Wahhab, from six or seven persons- The History of (۱۱ .Damascus, vol. ۲ p. ۱۹

p: ۳۹

Sa’id bin Wahhab and Abd Khayr, from some persons-The History of Damascus, vol. ۲ (۱۲ .p. ۲۰

.Zayd bin Arqam, from sixteen persons-Musnad, vol. ۵ p. ۳۷۰ (۱۳

Abut-Tufayl, from many persons-Musnad, vol. ۴ p. ۳۷۰ (۱۴

.Abut-Tufayl, from thirty persons- Musnad, vol. ۴ p. ۳۷۰ (۱۵

.Abut-Tufayl, from seventeen persons- Al-Isaaba, vol. ۴ p. ۱۵۶ (۱۶

.(Abu Zumayla, from some persons- (Ibn abul-Hadid’s book, Sharh Nahjul-Balagha (۱۷

.Abdur-Rahman bin Abu Leyla, to twelve people- Musnad, vol. ۱ p. ۱۱۸ (۱۸

.Abdur- Rahman bin Abu Leyla-The History of Damascus, vol.۲ p. ۹ (۱۹

.Also Abdur-Rahman bin Abu Leyla-The History of Damascus, vol.۲ p. ۹ (۲۰

.Amr bin Sa’d, from six persons- Al-Khasa’is, p. ۲۱ (۲۱

.Umayra bin Sa’d, from twelve persons- Hilyatul-Awliya’, vol. ۵ p. ۲۶ (۲۲

.Umayra, from eighteen persons-The History of Baghdad, vol. ۲ p. ۱۳ (۲۳

.Umayra, to eight-The History of Baghdad, vol. ۲ p. ۱۳ (۲۴

.Amr Dhi Mur, to some persons- Al Khasa’is, p. ۴۰ (۲۵

.Abu Qulaba, to more than ten people- Al-Kuna wa al-Asma’, vol. ۲ p. ۶۱ (۲۶

.Abu ‘Ishaq as-Subay’i, from more than ten people- Mushkil ul-Athar, vol. ۲ p. ۳۰۷ (۲۷

p: ۴۰

Abu Hurayra, Anas and Abu Sa'id, from nine persons and others besides- Majma'uz- (۲۸
.Zawa'id, vol. ۹ p. ۷۰۸

.Umar bin Abdul-Aziz, from some persons- Hilyatul-Awliya', vol. ۵ p. ۳۶۴ (۲۹

Abd Khayr, Amr Dhi Mur and Habbatul-Urani, from twelve people- Ibnul-Maghazili's (۳۰
.Manaqib p. ۲۰

.Al-Asbagh bin Nabata, from some persons- Al-Isaaba, vol. ۴ p. ۸۰ (۳۱

.Riyah bin al-Harith, from some of the Ansar- Musnad, vol. ۵ p. ۴۱۹ (۳۲

.Riyah bin al-Harith, from some people- Musnad, vol. ۵ p. ۴۱۹ (۳۳

.Salama, abu at-Tufeil from Hudhayfa bin Useid al-Ghifari- Ahmad's Manaqib (۳۴

Salama from Hudhayfa bin Usayd, at-Tirmidhi's Sahih, vol. ۱۳ p. ۱۶۵, The History of (۳۵
.Damascus, vol. ۲ p. ۴۵

.Ma'ruf, from Hudhayfa bin Usayd al-Ghifari (۳۶

.As'ad bin Zurara, from his father- Muwazihul-Awham, vol. ۱ p. ۹۱ (۳۷

.Isa bin Talha, from Talha bin Abdullah- Al-Kafi ash-Shafi, p. ۹۵ (۳۸

.Sa'd bin Abu Waqqas-The History of Damascus, vol. ۲ p. ۵۳ (۳۹

.Umar bin al-Khattab-The History of Damascus, vol. ۲ p. ۸۰ (۴۰

.Malik bin al-Huwayrith-The History of Damascus, vol. ۲ p. ۸۰ (۴۱

.Habashi bin Junada- Al-mu'jam ul- Kabir, p. ۱۲۷ (۴۲

.Amr Dhi Mur- Al-Bidayah wa an-Nihayah, vol. ۵ p. ۲۱۰ (۴۳

p: ۴۱

۴۴) Abdullah bin Bamil- al-Isaaba, vol.۲ p. ۳۷۴.

۴۵) Talha- Al-Kafi ash-Shafi, p. ۹۵.

۴۶) Habba bin Juwayn al-Urani- Usdul-Ghaba, vol.۱ p. ۳۷۶.

۴۷) Hamid bin Imara- Majma'uz-Zawa'id, vol.۹p. ۱۰۷.

۴۸) Bishr bin Harb, from Jarir- Al-Mu'jam ul-Kabir of At-Tabarani, p. ۱۲۷.

۴۹) Hamid at-Tawil, from Anas-Ibnul- Maghazili's Manaqib.

۵۰) Sa'd bin Malik- Mustadrak us-Sahiheyn, vol.۳ p. ۱۱۶.

۵۱) Abul-Hamra'- Arjah ul-Matalib, p. ۵۸۱.

۵۲) Musa bin Ayyub, from Abu Hurayra-The History of Baghdad, vol.۸ p. ۲۹۰.

۵۳) Al-Bazzar, from Abu Hurayra- Al-Khawarizmi's Manaqib, p. ۹۴.

۵۴) Ibrahim bin al-Husayn, from Abu Hurayra-The History of Damascus, vol.۲ p. ۷۲.

۵۵) Abu 'Ishaq al-Khitabi, from Abu Hurayra, Vol.۲ p. ۷۴.

۵۶) Mansur bin abul-Aswad, from Abu Hurayra-.... vol.۲ p. ۷۴.

۵۷) Abu Ya'la, from Abu Hurayra-The History of Damascus, vol.۲p. ۷۴.

۵۸) Abdullah bin Adiy, from Abu Hurayra-The History of Damascus, vol.۲ p. ۷۵.

۵۹) Habshun, from Abu Hurayra-The History of Damascus, vol.۲p. ۷۵.

۶۰) Ali bin Shu'eib, from Abu Hurayra-The History of Damascus, vol.۲ p. ۷۶.

۶۱) Ad-Daqqaq, from Abu Hurayra-The History of Damascus, vol.۲ p. ۷۷.

۶۲) Samra bin Jundub-The History of Damascus, vol.۲ p. ۷۱.

p: ۴۲

(۶۳ Shuriet bin Anas–The History of Damascus, vol.۲ p. ۷۲.

(۶۴ Abu Leyla bin Sa’id– Al–Jarh wet–Ta’dil, vol.۴ p. ۴۳۱.

(۶۵ Qubaysa, from Jabir bin Abdullah–The History of Damascus, vol.۲ p. ۶۵.

(۶۶ Qubaysa, from someone else–The History of Damascus, vol.۲ p. ۶۳.

(۶۷ Muhammad bin al–Munkadir, from Jabir bin Abdullah–The History of Damascus, vol.۲ p. ۶۵.

(۶۸ Abu Salama, from Muhammad bin al– Munkadir– Ibnul– Maghazili’s Manaqib, p. ۲۵.

(۶۹ Abdullah bin Muhammad bin Aqil, from Muhammad bin al– Munkadir– Kifayatu at–Talib, p. ۱۴.

(۷۰ Abdullah bin Muhammad bin Aqil, from someone else– The History of Damascus, vol.۲ p. ۶۲.

(۷۱ Abdur–Rahman bin Bahman–The History of Damascus, vol.۲ p. ۶۳.

(۷۲ Ibn Abbas bin Burayda– Al Khasa’is, p. ۲۱.

(۷۳ From another direction to Ibn Abbas from Burayda,– Al Khasa’is, p. ۲۱.

(۷۴ Tawus, from Burayda– Al–Mu’jamu s–Saghir, vol.۱ p. ۷۱.

(۷۵ From another direction, to Tawus, from Burayda– Hilyatul–Awliya’, vol.۴ p. ۲۳.

(۷۶ Sa’id bin Ubayda, from ibn Burayda, from his father, Ahmad’s Musnad, vol. ۵ p. ۳۵۸.

(۷۷ Sa’id bin Ubayda from another direction– Musnad, vol. ۵ p. ۳۵۸.

(۷۸ Sa’id bin Umayr, from ibn Burayda, from his father– Al Khasa’is, p. ۲۱.

p: ۴۳

Al-Mansur, from his father, from his grandfather, from Ibn Abbas-The History of (۷۹ .Baghdad, vol.۱۲ p. ۳۴۳

.Umar bin Maymun, from Ibn Abbas- Musnad, vol.۱ p. ۳۳۱ (۸۰

.Aamir bin Wathila- Talkhis ul-Mustadrak, vol.۳ p. ۱۰۹ (۸۱

.Aamir bin Wathila from another direction- Al Khasa'is, p. ۲۴ (۸۲

.Abdur-Rahman bin Abu Leyla-The History of Baghdad, vol.۱۴ p. ۲۳۶ (۸۳

.Abdur-Rahman bin Abu Leyla from another direction- Ibn Kathir's Tafsir, vol ۲ p. ۱۴ (۸۴

.Abdur- Rahman bin abu Leyla from a third direction- Tafsir, vol.۲ p. ۱۴ (۸۵

.Jundu' bin Amr bin Mazin- Usdu l-Ghaba, vol.۱ p. ۳۰۸ (۸۶

.(Tawus, from his father- Ahmad bin Hanbal's Manaqib, (Manuscript (۸۷

.Abu Leyla bin Sa'id, from his father- Al-Jarh wa at-Ta'dil, vol.۴ p. ۴۳۱ (۸۸

.Ya'la bin Murra- Usdu l-Ghaba, vol.۳ p. ۲۳۳ (۸۹

.Abu Ayyub- Al-mu'jam ul- Kabir, p. ۱۵۷ (۹۰

.Abu Ayyub from another direction- Usdu l-Ghaba, vol. ۵ p. ۶ (۹۱

.Abu Bastam, Usama's freed slave-The History of Damascus, vol.۲ p. ۸۶ (۹۲

.Alqama, from Abu Sa'id-al-Bukhari's book The History of Bukhari, vol.۲ p. ۱۹۴ (۹۳

.Al-Abdi, from Abu Sa'id- Al-Khawarizmi's Manaqib (۹۴

.Bint Ka'b (Ka'b's daughter) from Abu Sa'id- Al-Bidayah wa an-Nihayah, vol. ۵ p. ۲۰۸ (۹۵

p: ۴۴

Al-Abdi, from Abu Sa'id- Khawarizmi's Manaqib (۹۶.

Ali bin Khadim, from Abu Sa'id-The History of Damascus, vol.۲ p. ۶۹ (۹۷.

Abu Ubayd, from Ibn Maymun, from Zayd bin Arqam- Musnad, vol.۴ p. ۳۷۲ (۹۸.

Auf, from Ibn Maymun, from Zayd bin Arqam- Al Khasa'is, p. ۲۲ (۹۹.

Shu'ba, from Ibn Maymun, from Zayd bin Arqam- The History of Islam, vol.۲ p. ۱۹۶ (۱۰۰.

From another direction to Shu'ba, from Zayd bin Arqam- The History of Damascus, (۱۰۱ vol.۲ p. ۴۲.

Ibn Wathila, from Zayd bin Arqam- Mustadrakus-Sahiheyn, vol.۳ p. ۱۰۹ (۱۰۲.

Al-Hakam bin Abu Sulayman, from Zayd bin Arqam- Ibnu l-Maghazili's Manaqib, p. ۲۳ (۱۰۳.

Al-Hasan bin Kathir, from Zayd bin Arqam- Faza'ilu as-Sahaba, of As-Sam'ani, (۱۰۴ (Manuscript)).

Yahya bin Ja'da, from Zayd bin Arqam-The History of Damascus, vol.۲ p. ۴۱ (۱۰۵.

Abdul-Malik, from Zayd bin Arqam- Ahmad's Musnad, vol.۴ p. ۳۷۰ (۱۰۶.

Atiya al-Aufi, from Zayd bin Arqam-The History of Damascus, vol.۲ p. ۳۹ (۱۰۷.

From another direction to Atiya- Musnad, vol.۴ p. ۳۷۰ (۱۰۸.

Abu at-Tufayl, from Zayd bin Arqam- Al Khasa'is, p. ۲۱ (۱۰۹.

From another direction to Abu at-Tufayl, from Zayd bin Arqam- Al-Mu'jamu l-Kabir, p. (۱۱۰ (Manuscript ۱۲۷).

From another direction to Abu at-Tufayl, from Zayd bin Arqam- Kifayatu at-Talib, p. (۱۱۱ ۱۳-۱۴.

p: ۴۵

From another direction to Abu at-Tufayl, from Zayd bin Arqam- ibn Kathir's Tafsir, (۱۱۲ .vol.۲ p. ۱۴

.Abu Maryam or Zayd bin Arqam- Al-Bidayah wa an-Nihayah, vol.۷ p. ۳۴۸ (۱۱۳

.Abu Surayha or Zayd bin Arqam-The History of Damascus, vol.۲ p. ۳۶ (۱۱۴

.(Hudhayfa bin Usayd or Zayd bin Arqam- Al-Mu'jamu l-Kabir, p. ۱۵۷ (Manuscript (۱۱۵

.Abu Abdullah ash-Shami, from Zayd bin Arqam-The History of Damascus, vol.۲p. ۳۸ (۱۱۶

.Abuz-Zuha, from Zayd bin Arqam- Ibnul-Maghazili's Manaqib, p. ۲۰ (۱۱۷

.Zayd's wife, from Zayd bin Arqam- Ibnul-Maghazili's Manaqib, p. ۱۶ (۱۱۸

.Habibu l-Iskafi, from Zayd bin Arqam-The History of Damascus, vol.۲ p. ۴۱ (۱۱۹

.Abu 'Ishaq, from Zayd bin Arqam-The History of Damascus, vol.۲ p. ۴۱ (۱۲۰

.Yazid bin Talha- Al-Bidayah wa an-Nihayah, vol. ۵ p. ۱۰۸ (۱۲۱

.Abu 'Ishaq as-Subay'i, from al-Bara' bin Aazib- Al-Kuna wa al-Asma', vol.۱ p. ۱۶۰ (۱۲۲

.Abd bin Thabit, from al-Bara' bin Aazib- al-Khawarizmi's Manaqib, p. ۹۳ (۱۲۳

.Al-Bara' bin Aazib from another direction- Fara'idus-Samtein, vol.۱ p. ۶۴ (۱۲۴

.Al-Bara' bin Aazib from a third direction- Fara'idus-Samtein, vol.۱ p. ۶۵ (۱۲۵

.Al-Bara' bin Aazib from a fourth direction- Ibn Maja's Sunan, vol.۱ p. ۵۵ (۱۲۶

.Al-Bara' bin Aazib from a fifth direction- Musnad, vol.۴ p. ۲۸۱ (۱۲۷

p: ۴۶

.Al-Bara' bin Aazib from a sixth direction- Musnad, vol.۴ p. ۲۸۲ (۱۲۸

.Al-Bara' bin Aazib from a seventh direction- Al-Bidayah wa an-Nihayah, vol. ۵ p. ۲۰۸ (۱۲۹

.Al-Bara' bin Aazib from an eighth direction- Al-Bidayah wa an-Nihayah, vol. ۵ p. ۲۰۸ (۱۳۰

.Al Bara' bin Aazib from a ninth direction- Al-Bidayah wa an Nihayah, vol. ۵ p. ۲۰۸ (۱۳۱

.Al-Bara' bin Aazib from a tenth direction-The History of Damascus, vol.۲ p. ۴۸ (۱۳۲

.Al-Bara' bin Aazib from an eleventh direction-The History of Damascus, vol.۲ p. ۵۰ (۱۳۳

.Al-Bara' bin Aazib, from another direction-The History of Damascus vol.۲ p. ۵۰ (۱۳۴

Abu 'Ishaq, from al-Bara' bin Aazib and Zayd bin Arqam-The History of Damascus (۱۳۵ .vol.۲ p. ۵۲

.Hudhayfa bin al-Yaman-al-Hasaqani's Du'atul-Hudat (۱۳۶

.Ammar bin Yasir-Fara'idus-Samtein vol.۱ p. ۱۹۵ (۱۳۷

.Fatima (Prophet's daughter-peace be upon her)-Arjahul-Matalib p. ۴۴۸ and ۵۷۱ (۱۳۸

.Abdullah bin Mas'ud-ibnul-Maghazili's Manaqib p. ۲۳ (۱۳۹

Amr Dhi Mur, from Imam Ali-Mizanul-I'tidal vol.۲ p. ۳۰۳. The History of Damascus vol.۲ (۱۴۰ .p. ۳۰

.From another direction to Amr Dhi Mur, from Imam Ali-Fara'idus-Samtein vol.۱, p. ۶۷ (۱۴۱

.Abu Maryam and one of Imam Ali's Companions-Ahmad's Musnad vol.۱, p. ۱۵۲ (۱۴۲

p: ۴۷

۱۴۳) Umar bin Ali, from Imam Ali-Al-Bidayah wa an-Nihayah vol. ۵, p. ۲۲۱.

۱۴۴) Aamir bin Wathila, from Imam Ali-Khawarizmi's Manaqib, vol.۱, p. ۴۱.

۱۴۵) Salman, from Imam Ali-Khawarizmi's Manaqib, vol.۱ p. ۴۱.

۱۴۶) Zayd bin Wahhab and Abd Khayr, from Imam Ali-Ibn Kathir's Tafsir, vol.۲, p. ۱۴.

۱۴۷) Al-Husayn bin Ali, from Imam Ali-The History of Damascus, vol.۲, p. ۲۶.

۱۴۸) Umar bin Ali, from Imam Ali-The History of Damascus, vol.۲ p. ۲۸.

۱۴۹) Abu at-Tufayl, from Imam Ali-The History of Damascus, vol.۲, p. ۲۰.

۱۵۰) Zayd bin Arqam, from Imam Ali-The History of Damascus, vol.۲, p. ۲۰.

۱۵۱) Some persons, from ibn Abu Awfa-Al-Kuna of al-Bukhari, p. ۶۶.

۱۵۲) Atiyah, from ibn Abu Awfa-ibnul-Maghazili's Manaqib, p. ۲۴.

۱۵۳) Umayra bin Sa'd-ibn al-Maghazili's Manaqib, p. ۲۶.

۱۵۴) Amr bin al- Aas-Khawarizmi's Manaqib, p. ۱۲۵.

۱۵۵) Abdur-Rahman bin Saabit, from Sa'd bin Abu Waqqas-Ibn Maja's Sunan, vol.۱, p. ۵۸.

۱۵۶) Aamir bin Sa'd, from Sa'd bin Abu Waqqas-History of Islam, of ath-Thahabi, vol.۲.

۱۵۷) Ayman, from Sa'd bin Abu Waqqas-Al Khasa'is, p. ۴.

۱۵۸) Aa'isha bint Sa'd, from Sa'd bin Abu Waqqas-Al Khasa'is, ۲۴-۲۵'.

۱۵۹) From another direction to ('Aa'isha bint Sa'd).... from Sa'd bin abu Waqqas- Al-Bidayah wa an-Nihayah, vol. ۵ p. ۲۰۸.

p: ۴۸

Abu at-Tufeil, from Abu Qudama- Usdul-Ghaba, vol. ۵ p. ۲۷۶ (۱۶۰

Ya’la, from Aamir bin Leyla- Usdul-Ghaba, vol.۳ p. ۹۳ (۱۶۱

.Ya’la bin Murra, from Yazid or Zayd bin Shuraheel - Usdul-Ghaba, vol.۲ p. ۲۳۳ (۱۶۲

.Hudhayfa bin Usayd and Aamir bin Leyla bin Zamra- Usdul-Ghaba, vol.۳ p. ۹۲ (۱۶۳

.Aamir bin Leyla from another direction- Usdul-Ghaba, vol.۳ p. ۹۳ (۱۶۴

.Abu Amra, from Amr bin Mahz- Usdul-Ghaba, vol.۳ p. ۳۰۷ (۱۶۵

.Abu Zaynab- Usdul-Ghaba, vol.۳ p. ۳۰۷ (۱۶۶

.Sahl bin Hunayf- Usdul-Ghaba, vol.۳ p. ۳۰۷ (۱۶۷

.Khuzayma bin Thabit- Usdul-Ghaba, vol.۳ p. ۳۰۷ (۱۶۸

.Abdullah bin Thabit al-Ansari- Usdul-Ghaba, vol.۳ p. ۳۰۷ (۱۶۹

.Habashi bin Junada- Usdul-Ghaba, vol.۳ p. ۳۰۷ (۱۷۰

.Ubayd bin Aazib- Usdul-Ghaba, vol.۳ p. ۳۰۷ (۱۷۱

.Nu’Man bin Ajlan- Usdul-Ghaba, vol.۳ p. ۳۰۷ (۱۷۲

.Thabit bin Wadi’a- Usdul-Ghaba, vol.۳ p. ۳۰۷ (۱۷۳

Abu Fuzala al-Ansari- Usdul-Ghaba, vol.۳ p. ۳۰۷ (۱۷۴

.Ibn Umar-The History of Damascus, vol.۲ p. ۸۳ (۱۷۵

.Najiya bin Amr al-Khuza’i- Usdul-Ghaba, vol. ۵ p. ۶ (۱۷۶

.Miqdad bin Amr- Usdul-Ghaba, vol. ۵ p. ۶ (۱۷۷

.Zurr bin Hubaysh, from Abdullah bin Badil bin Warqa’- Al-Kashshi’s men, p. ۴۵ (۱۷۸

p: ۴۹

Al-Asbagh, from Ubayd bin Aazib al-Ansari- Usdul-Ghaba, vol.۳ p. ۳۰۷ and vol. ۵ p. ۲۰۵ (۱۷۹

.Amr bin al-Aas- Khawarizmi's Manaqib, p. ۱۲۶, Al-Imama wa as-Siyasa, p. ۹۳ (۱۸۰

.Qays bin Sa'd bin Ubada- Al-Kashshi's Rijal, p. ۴۵ (۱۸۱

.Ibn Abbas-Ahmad's Musnad, vol.۱ p. ۳۳۱ (۱۸۲

.Jabir bin Samra- Kanzul-Ummal, vol.۶ p. ۳۹۸ from Ibn abu Sheiba (۱۸۳

Sulaym bin Qays, from some persons, one of them was Abu Dharr- Fara'idus- (۱۸۴ .Samtein, vol.۱ p. ۳۱۵

.Hasan bin Thabit- Fara'idus-Samtein, vol.۱ p. ۷۳ (۱۸۵

.Habib bin Badil bin Warqa'- Usdul-Ghaba, vol.۱ p. ۳۶۸ (۱۸۶

.Qays bin Thabit bin Shamaas – Usdul-Ghaba, vol.۱ p. ۳۶۷ (۱۸۷

.Hashim bin Utba- Usdul-Ghaba, vol.۱ p. ۳۶۸ (۱۸۸

Other sources of The Ghadir tradition

This tradition was mentioned in the books of the Sunnis in other ways and by Companions other than those mentioned above. Unfortunately, we could not find the names of all its .narrators

Al-Hafiz bin Uqda mentioned it in his book Al-Wilayah, —chap. At-Tara'if, p. ۱۴۰ and (۱۸۹ .Abu Bakr al-Ju'abi in his book Al-Manaqib, vol.۳ p. ۲۵ narrated by Abu Bakr bin Abu Quhafa

Al-Hafiz bin Uqda in his book, —chap. At-Tara'if, p. ۱۴۲ (۱۹۰

Abu Bakr al-Ju'abi in his book Al-Manaqib, vol.۳ p. ۲۶ narrated by Ubei bin Ka'b (۱۹۱

p: ۵۰

Ibn Uqda in At-Tara'if, p. ١۴٢ by Asma' bint Umays al-Khatha'miya (١٩٢

(Ibn Uqda- At-Tara'if, p. ١۴٢ by Umm Salama (the Prophet's wife (١٩٣

.Ibn Uqda-At-Tara'if, p. ١۴٢ by Jibila bin Amr al-Ansari (١٩۴

Ibn Uqda, At-Tara'if, p. ١۴١ and Abu Bakr al-Ju'abi in his book Al-Manaqib, vol.٣ p. ٢۶ by (١٩۵ .(Imam Husayn bin Ali (peace be upon them

Abu Bakr al-Ju'abi, Al-Manaqib, vol.٣ p. ٢۶ by Khalid bin al-Walid (١٩۶

.Ibn Uqda in his book Al-Wilayah, —chap. At-Tara'if, p.١۴٢ by Sa'id bin Sa'd bin Ubada (١٩٧

.Ibn Hajar in his book Al-Isaaba, vol.٢ p. ٢۵۵ narrated by Aamir bin Umayr an-Nimyari (١٩٨

.Ibn Uqda, Al-Wilayah —chap. At-Tara'if, p. ١۴٢ by 'Aa'isha bint Abu Bakr (١٩٩

.Ibn al-Maghazili, Al-Manaqib p. ٢٧ by Abdur-Rahman bin Auf (٢٠٠

Ibn Uqda and al- Khawarizmi in his book Maqtal, p. ۴٨ by Abdur-Rahman bin Ya'mur (٢٠١ .ad-Daylami

.Ibn Uqda, Tara'if, p. ١۴١ by Abdullah bin Abu Abdul-Asad al-Makhzumi (٢٠٢

.Ibn Uqda, Tara'if, p.١۴٢ by Abdullah bin Bashir al-Mazini (٢٠٣

.Ibn Uqda, Tara'if, p. ١۴١ by Abdullah bin Ja'far (٢٠۴

.Ibn Uqda, Tara'if, p. ١۴١ by Uthman bin Affan (٢٠۵

.Ibn Uqda, Tara'if, p. ١۴٢ by Abu Wasma Wahshi bin Harb (٢٠۶

p: ۵١

.Ibn Uqda, Tara'if, p. ۱۴۲ by Abu Juhayfa Wahhab bin Abdullah (۲۰۷

Mentioned by Abu Hatim, Ibn Asaakir and Muhibbud-Din at-Tabari in book Arjahul- (۲۰۸ .Matalib, p. ۳۳۹ by Ibn Shurayh

Abu Bakr al-Ju'abi, Manaqib, vol.۳ p. ۲۴ and Ibn Uqda, Tara'if, p. ۱۴۱ by Rifa'a bin (۲۰۹ Abdul-Munthir

Ibn Uqda, Tara'if, p. ۱۴۱ and Ibnul-Maghazili, Manaqib, p. ۲۷ by az-Zubeir bin al- (۲۱۰ .Awwam

.Ibn Uqda, Tara'if, p. ۱۴۲ by Zayd bin Abdullah (۲۱۱

.Ibn Uqda, Tara'if, p. ۱۴۲ by Sa'd bin Junada (۲۱۲

.Abu Bakr al-Ju'abi, Manaqib, vol.۳ p. ۲۶ by Sa'd bin Ubada (۲۱۳

.Ibn Uqda, Tara'if, p. ۱۴۱ by Salman al-Farisi (۲۱۴

'Ibn Uqda, Tara'if, p. ۱۴۱ by Salama bin Amr bin al-Aqua (۲۱۵

.Ibn Uqda, Tara'if, p. ۱۴۲ by Abu Umama as-Sadiy bin Ajlan al-Bahili (۲۱۶

.Ibn Uqda, Tara'if, p. ۱۴۲ by Zumayra al- Asadi (۲۱۷

.Ibnul-Maghazili, Manaqib, p. ۲۷ by al-Fazl bin Muhammad from Sa'id bin Zayd (۲۱۸

.Ibn Hajar, Isaaba, vol.۲ p. ۲۵۵ by Musa bin Aqtal from Aamir bin Umayr (۲۱۹

.Ibn Hajar, Isaaba, vol.۳ p. ۲۵۷ by Aamir bin Leyla al- Ghifari (۲۲۰

At-Tabarani, Ihya'ul-Mayyit, by Abdullah bin Huntub (۲۲۱

.Khawarizmi, Maqtal, p. ۴۸ by Abdullah bin Rabi'a (۲۲۲

p: ۵۲

۲۲۳) Khawarizmi, Maqtal, p. ۴۸ by Amr bin Shurahil.

۲۲۴) At-Tabarani, Kanzul-Ummal, vol.۶ p. ۱۵۴ and Ahmad bin Hanbal, by Amr bin Murra

۲۲۵) Ibn Uqda, Tara'if, p. ۱۴۱ and Abu Bakr al-Ju'abi, Manaqib, vol.۳ p. ۲۶ by Abul-Haytham bin at-Tayhan.

۲۲۶) Ibn Uqda, Tara'if, p. ۱۴۱ and Abu Bakr al-Ju'abi, Manaqib, vol.۳ p. ۲۶ by Abu Rafi'

۲۲۷) Ibn Uqda, Tara'if, p. ۱۴۲ and Khawarizmi, Maqtal, p. ۴۸ by Abu Thuwayb

۲۲۸) Ibn Uqda, Tara'if, p. ۱۴۲ by Umm Hani.

۲۲۹) Ibn Uqda, Tara'if, p. ۱۴۲ by Zayd bin Haritha.

۲۳۰) Ibn Uqda, Tara'if, p. ۱۴۲ by Abdullah bin Abu Awfa al- Aslami.

۲۳۱) Ibn Uqda, Tara'if, p. ۱۴۱ by Abdullah bin Umar bin al-Khattab.

۲۳۲) Ibn Uqda, Tara'if, vol.۳ p. ۱۴۲ by Abdur-Rahman bin Mudlaj.

۲۳۳) Abu Na'im, Hilyatul-Awliya', chap. Al-Yanabi' p. ۳۸ by seventeen persons, one of them was Adiy bin Hatim.

۲۳۴) Abu Na'im, Hilyatul- Awliya', chap. Al-Yanabi' p. ۳۸ by seventeen persons, one of them was Uqba bin Aamir.

۲۳۵) Ibn Uqda, Tara'if, p. ۱۴۱ by Umar bin Abu Salama.

۲۳۶) Ibn Uqda and Khawarizmi in his Maqtal, p. ۴۸ by Imran bin Husayn.

۲۳۷) Ibn Uqda, Khawarizmi, Maqtal, p. ۴۸ by Amr bin al-Hamq.

p: ۵۳

.Ibn Uqda, Tara'if, p. ١۴٢ by Fatima bint Hamza (٢٣٨

.Ibn Uqda, Tara'if, p. ١۴١ by al-Miqdad bin Amr (٢٣٩

.Ibn Uqda, Tara'if, p. ١۴١ by Abu Barza Fazla bin Utba (٢۴٠

.Ibn Uqda, Tara'if, p. ١۴٢ by Atiya bin Bisr (٢۴١

Abu Bakr al-Ju'abi, Manaqib, vol.٣ p. ٢۶ by Ubada bin as-Samit (٢۴٢

Abu Bakr al-Ju'abi, Manaqib, vol.٣ p. ٢۶ by Abdullah bin Unays (٢۴٣

Abu Bakr al Ju'abi, Manaqib, vol.٣ p. ٢۶ by Urwa bin Abu al-Ja'd (٢۴۴

Abu Bakr al-Ju'abi, Manaqib, vol.٣ p. ٢۶ by Amr bin Hurayth (٢۴۵

Abu Bakr al-Ju'abi, Manaqib, vol.٣ p. ٢۶ by Abdul-A'la bin Adiy (٢۴۶

Abu Bakr al-Ju'abi, Manaqib, vol.٣ p. ٢۶ by Uthman bin Hunayf (٢۴٧

Abu Bakr al-Ju'abi, Manaqib, vol.٣ p. ٢۶ by Bashir bin Abdul-Munthir (٢۴٨

Abu Bakr al-Ju'abi, Manaqib, vol.٣ p. ٢۶ by Qays bin Aasim and by Abu Kahil on the (٢۴٩ same page

...Abu (٢۵٠

Abu Bakr al-Ju'abi, Manaqib, vol.٣ p. ٢۶ by Abu Rifa'a (٢۵١

Abu Bakr al-Ju'abi, Manaqib, vol.٣ p. ٢۶ by Hubab bin Utba (٢۵٢

Abu Bakr al-Ju'abi, Manaqib, vol.٣ p. ٢۶ by Jundub bin Sufyan (٢۵٣

.Abu Bakr al-Ju'abi, Manaqib, vol.٣ p. ٢۶ by Khabbab bin Samra (٢۵۴

p: ۵۴

QUR'ANIC VERSES concerning The Homage AT AL-Ghadir

:The First Verse: Allah says

O Apostle! Deliver what has been revealed to you from your Lord; and if you do it not, then you have not delivered His message, and Allah will protect you from the people; (surely Allah will not guide the unbelieving people. (٥:٦٧

This Qur'anic verse had descended in order to reveal Imam Ali's guardianship. This fact has been mentioned in the books of the Sunnis. The author of Al-Ghadir has quoted this in .vol.١ p. ٢١۴ –٢٢٣ from thirty of their books

:The Second Verse: Allah says

This day have I perfected for you your religion and completed My favor on you and (chosen for you Islam as a religion. (٥:٣

Al-Amini, in his book Al-Ghadir, vol. ١ p. ٢٣٠, has quoted the narrations that confirm that .this verse concerned the divine leadership of Imam Ali from sixteen books of the Sunnis

:The Third Verse: Allah says

A questioner asked about a chastisement, about to fall for the unbelievers. There is none (to avert it from Allah, the Lord of the ways of Ascent. (٧٠:١–٣

:This verse was revealed because someone, when he heard the Prophet saying

Of whomsoever I had been guardian, Ali here is to be his guardian,"— said, 'O Allah, if" '.what Muhammad is saying is true, let heaven send stones upon us

A little after that Allah sent down a stone on his head and killed him. Then Allah revealed .(this verse to Prophet Muhammad (s

p: ٥٥

Al-Amini quoted that in his book Al-Ghadir, vol.١ p. ٢٣٩ -٢۴۶ from thirty of the books of the .Sunnis

The Companions pay homage to Imam Ali and congratulate him

:At-Tabari said

:Then people began to say”

yes, we have heard and obeyed the order of Allah and his Messenger with our hearts.” The first of those who shook hands with Prophet Muhammad (s) and Imam Ali were Abu Bakr, Umar, Uthman, Talha, az-Zubeir, the rest of the Muhajirs (emigrants), the Ansar (helpers) and the public. They continued this until the Prophet (s) led them in the congregational Zhuhr (noon) Prayer and the Asr (afternoon) Prayer combined. They kept on doing this until he (s) led them in congregational Maghrib (sunset) Prayer and the ‘Isha’ (evening) Prayer both of them also combined. Thus they carried on paying homage and “.shaking hands for three days

The author of Al-Ghadir quoted, in vol. ١ p. ٢٧٢, the news of Umar bin al-Khattab .congratulating Imam Ali from sixty Sunni books

the Linguistic meaning of Mawla

The Arabic word (Mawla) means to take charge of something and to achieve it. The :author of As-Sihah says

The ruler is the mawla i.e. he takes charge of the country. A man is mawla i.e. he takes” charge of something, for example, selling. One says that someone was the mawla -i.e. took charge- of something, and was given charge of it. For example the commander made someone take charge of something or someone was put in charge of selling “.something, and he took charge of the job

p: ۵۶

:The author of An-Nihayah says

Wilaya –guardianship- means administration with ability and action. Whoever takes" charge of something becomes its Mawla –guardian-... Umar's saying to Ali, 'You have become the mawla (guardian) of every believer,' means taking charge of every believer's ".affairs

:The author of al-Qamus says

Wilaya –guardianship- means policy, command, and authority. Being the Mawla i.e." taking charge of something means being responsible for it. To take charge of the orphan ..."means to be responsible for his affairs

:The author of Lisan ul-Arab says

Sibawayh says, "Wilaya stands for the guardianship of someone; taking charge of his" affairs and fulfilling his needs. The mawla (guardian) of a woman is he who undertakes the responsibility of contracting marriage on her behalf; she cannot get married without his agreement. Prophet Muhammad (s) says: (For women who got married without the (.permission of their guardians, their marriage is invalid

Thus, the real meaning of this word (mawla) is to take charge of a matter and to carry it out. The various uses of the expression simply express this basic fact, such as saying the word 'man' for Zayd, Amr and Bakr. Allah is called Mawla because He is the ruler of the affairs of Man. The master is addressed as mawla because he is in charge of his slave, and the slave is also called mawla because he is in charge of carrying out his master's affairs. Likewise, neighbors, cousins, allies and sons-in-law are called mawla because ".they help those who need their help. So, it has a common literal meaning

p: ۵٧

So, the meaning of Prophet's saying (Of whomsoever I am guardian, Ali here is to be his guardian) is that over whomsoever I took charge of his affairs, Ali will take charge of his affairs. This is clear concerning the leadership, imamate and guardianship of the nation. Since the Prophet Muhammad (s) was the leader, guardian and commander of the nation, .so also will Ali

This is the real meaning of the word according to the opinions of the linguists. If one rejects this meaning in preference for the other manifold meanings of the word 'mawla', it would be a word that would be common in expression, but having various meanings independent from each other. In this case there would be no doubt that the meaning that agrees with the tradition would be the first one. Some senior scholars have discussed this subject in their books. Abu Ubayda says in his book Ghareebul-Qur'an: "Mawla means .worthier." He cited al-Akhtal's poetic verse to Abdul-Malik bin Marwan as his evidence

:Al-Anbari said in his book Tafsirul-Mushkil fil-Qur'an

".Mawla means the worthier"

Az-Zajjaj and al-Farra' said, as mentioned in al-Fakhr ar-Razi's book At-Tafsir, vol. ۲۹ p. ۲۲۷, Egyptian edition that

".Mawla means worthier"

It was mentioned that Abul-Abbas al- Mubarrid had said that Mawla means worthier and .most deserving

:Az-Zamakhshari said in his Tafsir, vol. ۴ p. ۶۶, Egyptian edition

".In fact, Mawla means your place, where it would be better for you to be"

:Al-Halabi, in his book At-Taqrib, said

p: ۵۸

Mawla, in fact, means worthier and the other expressions are derived from it. The" master is a mawla because he is worthier to manage his slaves' affairs and to bear with their faults. The slave is a mawla because he is worthier to obey his master. So too are the freed slave, the helper who is more worthy of helping whom he helps, the ally to be more worthy of supporting his allies, the neighbor to be more worthy of helping his neighbor and defending him, the son-in-law to be more worthy of his relatives, the imam to be more worthy of whom he leads and the cousin to be more worthy of helping his ".cousins

Since the word (Mawla) means worthier, there is no excuse to turn it away from its real .meaning and seek other ones

Further evidence of the significance of the tradition of al-Ghadir

The First Evidence

The Prophet Muhammad (s) asked the people before appointing Imam Ali as guardian by :saying

Am I not worthier of your selves than you are?" Then he said: "Of whomsoever I had" ".been guardian, Ali here is to be his guardian

The Prophet, in getting them to confess that he (s) is worthier of themselves than they are, before he said: 'Of whomsoever I had been guardian, Ali here is to be his guardian,' clarifies one of two things: either

to confirm the matter and that they confessed to. In this case the following would (۱) therefore become a fact which would be that Mawla, then, means worthier and nothing else. Thus the Prophet's saying would mean, "am I not worthier of your selves than you are? Whoever's self I had been worthier than, Ali here is to be worthier of his self than he is." Or

p: ۵۹

forcing them not to deny what he (s) wanted after this by appointing Ali a commander (٢) and a ruler over them. Therefore, Mawla, here, means authority and leadership and .nothing else

In both cases, the hadith means that Imam Ali (a) had the right to dispose of their affairs .and that they had to obey him and not to prevent him from this

Moreover, Many Sunni and Shiite scholars have quoted the Prophet's saying, 'Of whomsoever I had been guardian, Ali here is to be his guardian,' after his saying, 'Am I not worthier of your selves than you are?' with slight differences in wording. Here are the :names of some of such scholars

Abu Hatim .١

Abu Musa .٢

Abu Na'im .٣

Abu Ya'la .۴

Abul-Faraj .۵

Ad-Darqutni .۶

Ahmad bin Hanbal .٧

Al-Aasimi .٨

Al-Anbari .٩

Al-Ayji .١٠

Al-Badkhashi .١١

Al-Bayhaqi .١٢

Al-Bayzaawi .١٣

Al-Hakim .١۴

Al-Halabi .١٥

Al-Hamawini .١۶

Al-Hasakani .١٧

Al-Haythami .١٨

Al-Jazari .١٩

Al-Kanji .٢٠

Al-Khal'i .٢١

Al-Khatib .٢٢

Al-Khawarizmi .٢٣

Al-Maqrizi .٢۴

Al-Maybadi .٢۵

Al-Mulla .٢۶

Al-Qati'i .٢٧

Al-Wassabi .٢٨

p: ۶٠

An–Nisaa’i .۲۹

Ash–Sharif .۳۰

Ash–Shaybani .۳۱

Ash–Shaykhani .۳۲

As–Saharniwari .۳۳

As–Sajistani .۳۴

As–Sam’ani .۳۵

As–Samhudi .۳۶

As–Suyuti .۳۷

Asilud–Din .۳۸

Ath–Tha’labi .۳۹

Ath–Thahabi .۴۰

At–Tabarani .۴۱

At–Tabari .۴۲

<"span class="h

At–Taftazani .۴۳

At–Tahawi .۴۴

At–Tirmidhi .۴۵

Az–Zarandi .۴۶

Gazz Aughli .۴۷

Ibn Asaakir .۴۸

Ibn Batta .۴۹

Ibn Hajar .۵۰

Ibn Hajar al-Makki .۵۱

Ibn Kathir .۵۲

Ibn Maja .۵۳

Ibn Uqda .۵۴

Ibnul-Athir .۵۵

Ibnul-Maghazili .۵۶

Ibnus-Sabbagh .۵۷

Ibnus-Samaan .۵۸

Kamalud-Din .۵۹

Muhibud-Din .۶۰

Shihabud-Din .۶۱

Waliyyud-Din .۶۲

Zia'ud-Din .۶۳

The Second Evidence

The second evidence is the Prophet's supplication to Allah for Imam Ali (a) by saying, "O Allah, be a supporter of whoever supports him and an enemy of whoever opposes him, and help whoever helps him and betray whoever betrays him." This is mentioned at the end of the hadith in many forms. It shows that the matter that the Prophet (s) had conveyed concerning Ali (a) needed help and support and that Imam Ali would have enemies and betrayers. In addition, it shows that Imam Ali (a) was infallible for he did not .set about doing anything unless it was for the sake of Allah's pleasure

The Third Evidence

Various narratives show that the Qur'anic verse (This day have I perfected for you your religion and completed My favour on you and chosen for you Islam as a religion. ۵:۳) had been revealed for this occasion. That which is a cause for perfecting the religion and completing the Divine favor upon the Muslims must be among the principles of the religion. A principle by which the order of life and religion would be completed and through which the efforts of the Muslims would be accepted. Some narrations of the hadith mentioned in some books confirm this point. They attest that the Prophet (s), after telling this hadith continued by saying, "Allah is the greatest for the perfection of this religion and the completion of the favor, and for His contentment with my mission and the guardianship of Ali bin Abu Talib." In other narratives, the following form is recorded: "... ".and the perfection of Allah's religion by Ali's guardianship after me

The Fourth Evidence

Many narratives show that the Qur'anic verse (O Apostle! Deliver what has been revealed to you from your Lord; and if you do it not, then you have not delivered His message, and Allah will protect you from the people. ۵:۶۷,) was revealed for this occasion (Ghadir Khum), too. The verse showed the importance of this matter and it compared leaving this matter (informing of Ali's guardianship) with leaving the Islamic mission as a whole. It also showed that it was a principle of religion, but it was not about Divine Unity, prophecy or resurrection that the Prophet (s) had informed of at the beginning of his mission. Nothing remained except the imamate of Ali (a), which the Prophet was hesitant to convey because he was afraid of the people. Therefore, Allah says, Allah will protect you from the (people. (۵:۶۷

p: ۶۲

The Fifth Evidence

Many narratives have been mentioned in the reference books of hadith concerning the Qur'anic verse, "This day have I perfected for you your religion and completed My favour on you," (۵:۳). They have explained that it had been revealed after the event of al-Gh

The Sixth Evidence

The Prophet (s) said in some narrations of this tradition, "Allah had sent me with a mission, which my heart was unable to bear and I thought that the people would not believe me. ".Then Allah threatened me with Divine torment if I did not convey it

The Seventh Evidence

This hadith has confirmed in many ways, that the Prophet (s) uttered this honorable saying after he had gotten the people to confess the Oneness of Allah and the Prophecy of Muhammad (s). This fact shows that this matter was very important for Islam and was .considered as one of the fundamentals of faith

The Eighth Evidence

:Before he had conveyed this important matter, the Prophet (s) had said

".I am about to be called (to die) and I am to respond"

This shows that the Prophet (s) was afraid of leaving something very important which he .had to reveal before his death. It was nothing but Ali's guardianship

The Ninth Evidence

:The Prophet (s) said after conveying the news of Ali's guardianship

".Let him who is present inform him who is absent"

.This shows that he was very concerned that this matter reached all the Muslims

The Tenth Evidence

p: ۶۳

:The Prophet (s) said after the conveying the news of Ali's guardianship

".O Allah, You are a witness that I have informed and advised"

This shows that he informed of a great and important matter which he had made the .Muslims for and had acquitted himself of this great duty

The Eleventh Evidence

There is the factual evidence that is clear and copious confirming the purpose of this tradition. For example, when the Prophet (s) stopped in the desert in the heat of the midday sun. The narrators of Hadith and historians mention that it was so hot that some people had to put cloths over their heads, some had covered their heads with their saddlebags, some sat in the shade of their camels and others sat in the shade of the rocks. Then the Prophet (s) asked his Companions to erect a high platform of camel saddles and stones in order to see over all Muslims who were about seventy, eighty or .one hundred thousand as some historians have said

The Prophet (s) ordered the Muslims who had gone ahead to return and those who had .been behind to halt

Then he (s) took Ali with him up the platform, held his hand, and raised it until the white of .the Prophet's armpit appeared to the lookers

The Twelfth Evidence

People paid homage to Imam Ali (a); shook hands with him, and congratulated both him and the Prophet. It was mentioned that Umar bin al-Khattab was the first to congratulate him. The hadith of Umar's congratulation of Imam Ali has come down to us in more than sixty different forms. Abu Sa'id an-Neisaburi (died in ۴٠٧ A.H.) mentioned in his book Sharaful-Mustafa about the event of Ghadir according to a tradition narrated by Ahmad bin Hanbal from al-Bara' bin Aazib and another one narrated by Abu Sa'id al-Khudri, that the Prophet (s) said: "Congratulate me! Congratulate me! For Allah has favored me with Prophecy and favored my family with Imamate." Then Umar bin al-Khattab met Imam Ali and said: "May you be blest, you have become my guardian and the guardian of every ".believer; men and women

p: ۶۴

At-Tabari mentioned in his book al-Wilayah a tradition narrated by Zayd bin Arqam that the Prophet Muhammad (s) had said, "Say that we have given a vow from ourselves and a word from our tongues and a homage with our hands which we pass on to our offspring and to our families. We will never change that..."

The author of Rawzatus-Safa mentioned in vol. ١ p. ١٧٣, that Prophet Muhammad (s) sat in a tent and let Imam Ali sit in another. He ordered people to congratulate Imam Ali in his tent. When the men had finished congratulating Imam Ali, the Prophet (s) ordered his wives to go and congratulate Imam Ali.

Al-Ghazali said in his book Sirrul-Aalameen, in the Fourth Essay:

((The fact was crystal clear and the public had unanimously agreed on with the content of the Prophet's speech when he said on that Day in Ghadir Khum:

"Of whomsover I had been guardian, Ali here is to be his guardian."

Umar then said: "Excellent, O Abul-Hasan (Imam Ali's surname)! You have become my guardian as well as that of every believer; man and woman."

Thus there was acceptance, approval and the appointment of his leadership. But later on this right was defeated by the passion for being in charge, for bearing the title of the caliphate, for the waving of ensigns and the snorting of horses in the wars and for conquering countries. All of this made them drink the cup of vanity and go back to the first discord. They threw the right behind their backs and sold it for a little price, and what a bad thing they had bought!))

p: ٦٥

The Thirteenth Evidence

The incident of al-Harith bin an-Nu'Man al-Fihri is another piece of evidence. It has been mentioned by many historians, one of which was ath-Tha'labi in his Tafsir. The Prophet (s) :in Ghadir Khum, called for people to gather, then he took Ali's hand, and said

".Of whomsoever I had been guardian, Ali here is to be his guardian"

The news spread everywhere and reached al-Harith bin an-Nu'man al-Fihri. He came on his camel until he reached a place called al-Abtah. He rode off and hobbled his camel. He came to the Prophet (s) with some of Companions and said: "O Muhammad, you had ordered us, from Allah, to witness that there is no god but Allah and that you are His Messenger and we accepted. And you had ordered us to pray five times a day and we accepted. And you had ordered us to go to Mecca to perform the Hajj and we accepted. All of that did not please you until you raised your cousin's hand to prefer him among us and you said, of whomsoever I had been guardian Ali here is to be his guardian! Is this from you or from Allah?" The Prophet (s) said: "I swear by Allah other than Whom there is ".no other god, that this is from none other but Allah

:Al-Harith went towards his camel saying

O Allah, if what Muhammad said was true then let the heavens shower us with stones or" bring us painful torment." Before he could reach his camel, Allah hurled a stone at him that descended upon the crown of his head and exited out from the other side and killed .him

p: ۶۶

:It was mentioned in many traditions that the Qur'anic verses

One demanding demanded the chastisement, which must befall the unbelievers... (٧٠:١-٣), .had been revealed for this occasion

The Fourteenth Evidence

Hasan bin Thabit asked permission from the Prophet (s) to describe the event in poetry. His poems have been repeatedly narrated and mentioned in both Sunni and Shiite books. :Hasan wrote

,Their Apostle called upon them on the Day of Ghadir Khum

.What a caller he was, the best

?"He said: "Who is your guardian and who is your Apostle

They said, and no one refrained

,Your Allah is our Guardian and you are our Apostle"

".You will not find anyone of us disobedient

.Then he said "O Ali, rise

.I have chosen you to be Imam and a guide after me

.Of him whose guardian was I, this is to be his guardian

".Be, for him, followers truthful

: Then he prayed

".O Allah, help whoever helps him, And be an enemy for Ali's enemy"

Ibnu-al Jawzi and Abu Abdullah al-Kanji ash-Shafi'ee said that the Prophet (s) said after :hearing that poem

".O Hasan, you are still aided by Holy Spirit whenever you strive for us with your tongue"

Qays bin Ubada al-Ansari said the following poem in the presence of Imam Ali during the battle of Siffin:

I said, when the enemy had oppressed us,

'It is enough for us to rely on Allah, our Guardian,

p: ۶۷

‘,And Ali, our Imam and our standard bearer

.As it had been revealed in the Holy Qur’an

,When the Prophet said, Of whomsoever I had been guardian

.This is to be his guardian, great and honorable

The Fifteenth Evidence

Imam Ali came to the courtyard of Kufa Mosque while the people were gathered there and asked about this tradition in order to refute his dissenters in the matter of caliphate. :He said

I ask anyone to bear witness before Allah if he had heard the Prophet say, on that day in” :Ghadir Khum

“.Of whomsoever I had been guardian, Ali here is to be his guardian”

.Some people then stood up and testified

Accounts of Imam Ali’s urgent appeal spread so widely that it reached a degree of wide .transmission

:Al-Hamawini said in his book Fara’id as-Samtein

Zayd bin Arqam, al-Bara’ bin Aazib, Salman and Abu Dharr stood up and said, ‘We testify” that we remember that the Prophet Muhammad (s) was on the pulpit when he said: “O people, Allah ordered me to appoint your Imam who is in charge of your affairs after me to be my inheritor and successor. He is to be obeyed by all believers according to Allah’s order as in the Qur’an. Allah made obedience to him as same as obedience to me and He .ordered you to take him as guardian... etc

The Sixteenth Evidence

Some books on hadith have expressed the occurrence of this event as a nomination. The Prophet Muhammad (s) had nominated Imam Ali as guardian. It is clear that such a .nomination was not just to show love for some physical object

p: ۶۸

The Ninth Spurious Argument

?WHO IS THE FAMILY OF THE PROPHET

Some people criticize the Shias for limiting the Prophet's family to Imam Ali, Fatima and their sons Hasan and Husayn (peace be upon them) and excluding the Prophet's wives .and uncles

The Prophet's sayings prove that his family members are only those five persons. Such .sayings, narrated by some of the Companions are mentioned in many Sunni books

The answer

At-Tirmidhi mentioned in his book as-Sahih, vol. ١٣ p. ٢٠٠ – Egyptian edition-, a tradition narrated by Umar bin Abu Salama where he said that the Qur'anic verse, "Allah only desires to keep away the uncleanness from you, O people of the House, and to purify you with a thorough purification. (٣٣:٣٣)," was revealed in Umm Salama's house. Then the Prophet (s) called for Fatima, Hasan, Husayn and Imam Ali to come behind him. He then covered themselves with a garment and said: "O Allah, these are my family. Keep away ".uncleanness from them and purify them thoroughly

Umm Salama said, 'am I with them?' The Prophet answered, 'You have your standing and '.you will be to a good end

The author mentioned other relations that are narrated by Umm Salama, Ma'qil bin .Yassar, Abul-Hamra' and Anas bin Malik

Hereunder, we will mention some sources of the Prophet's saying regarding the above-mentioned Qur'anic verse of Purification concerning Imam Ali, Fatima, Hasan and Husayn, that are recorded in Sunni books quoted from our book Jami' Barahin Usul ul-:I'tiqadaat

Narrated by Umar bin Atiyah, from Abu Sa'id al-Khudri from Umm Salama (The History .١ .of Baghdad) vol.٩ p. ١٢٦

p: ٦٩

Al-Husayn bin al-Hasan from Abu Sa'id al-Khudri from Umm Salama (The Prophet's .۲ wife) (The History of Baghdad) vol.۹ p. ۱۲۶

Hisham bin Salim, from Wahhab bin Abdullah, from Umm Salama (Al-Mu'jam ul- Kabir) .۳ .p. ۱۳۴

.Abdul-Malik bin Sulayman from Ata' from Umm Salama (Al-Mu'jam ul- Kabir) p. ۱۳۴ .۴

.Sharik bin Namr, Ata', Umm Salama (Ma'alimut-Tanzil) p. ۲۱۳ .۵

.Muhammad bin Sawqa from someone from Umm Salama (Akhlaq un-Nabi) p. ۱۱۶ .۶

Abdullah bin Abu Riyah, from someone, from Umm Salama (Ath-Tha'labi's Tafsir) . ۷ .Manuscript

.Abdullah bin Abu Riyah, Hakim bin Sa'd, Umm Salama (Ibn Kathir's Tafsir) vol.۳ p. ۴۸۳ .۸

.Atiyah from his father from Umm Salama (Ibn Kathir's Tafsir) vol.۳ p. ۴۸۳ .۹

.Atiyah, from Shahr bin Hawshab, from Umm Salama (Ibn Kathir's Tafsir) vol.۳ p. ۴۸۳ .۱۰

.Sufyan bin Zayd, Shahr bin Hawshab, Umm Salama (At-Tirmidhi's Sahih) vol.۱۳ p. ۲۴۸ .۱۱

.Zubayd, Shahr bin Hawshab, Umm Salama (Mawzzihul- Awham) vol.۲ p. ۲۸۱ .۱۲

Abdul-Hamid bin Bihram, Shahr bin Hawshab, Umm Salama (Ahmad's Musnad) vol.۶ p. .۱۳ .۲۹۸

.Dawud bin Abu Auf, Shahr bin Hawshab, Umm Salama (Al-Qawlul-Fasl) vol.۲ p. ۱۷۷ .۱۴

.Ajlah, Shahr bin Hawshab, Umm Salama (Ahmad's Musnad) vol.۲ p. ۱۷۳ .۱۵

.Athal, Shahr bin Hawshab, Umm Salama (Al-Bukhari's History) vol.۱ p. ۷۰ .۱۶

.Shu'eib bin al-Minii', Shahr bin Hawshab, Umm Salama (Al-Bukhari's History) vol.۱ p. ۷۰ .۱۷

p: ۷۰

Ja'far bin Abdur-Rahman, al-Hakam bin Sa'id, Umm Salama (Al-Bukhari's History) vol.۱ .۱۸ .p. ۷۰

.Muhammad bin Shirin, Abu Hurayra, Umm Salama (Tafsir Jami'ul-Bayan) vol.۲۲ p. ۷ .۱۹

.Awaam bin Hawshab, from his cousin, from 'Aa'isha (Al-Qawlul-Fassl) vol.۲ p. ۲۱۵ .۲۰

.Mus'ab bin Sheiba, Safiyyah, 'Aa'isha (as-Sunanul-Kubra) vol.۲ p. ۱۴۹ .۲۱

.Awza'i, Abu Ammar, Wathila bin al-Asqa' (Mustadrak) vol.۲ p. ۱۵۲ .۲۲

Abdur-Rahman bin Amr, Shaddad bin Abdullah, Wathila bin al-Asqa' (Siyer A'lamin- .۲۳ .Nubala') vol.۳ p. ۲۱۲

.Al- A'mash, Atiyah, Abu Sa'id al-Khudri, (Jami'ul-Bayan) vol.۲۲ p. ۶ .۲۴

.Abul-Hijaf, Atiyah, Abu Sa'id al-Khudri (Al-Mu'jam us Saghir) vol.۱ p. ۱۳۴ .۲۵

.Imran bin Muslim, Atiyah, Abu Sa'id al- Khudri (The History of Baghdad) vol.۱۰ .۲۶

.Ibn Umar al-Kirmani, Atiyah, Abu Sa'id al-Khudri (Tabaqatul-Muhadditheen) p. ۱۴۹ .۲۷

Abdur-Rahman bin Abu Bakr, Isma'il, from his father Abdullah bin Ja'far (Al-Qawlul- .۲۸ .Fasl) p. ۱۸۵

.Abdur-Rahman bin Abu Bakr, Ibn Abbas (Arjahul-Matalib) p. ۵۴ .۲۹

.Hammad bin Salama, Ali bin Zayd, Anas bin Malik (Ahmad's Musnad) vol.۳ p. ۲۵۹ .۳۰

.Abdur-Rahman bin Abu Bakr, Hamid, Anas bin Malik (Al-Mustadrak) vol.۳ p. ۱۵۹ .۳۱

.Abaad bin Abu Yahya, Abu Dawud (p. ۶), Abul-Hamra' (An-Najaari's Kuna) p. ۲۵ .۳۲

.Yunus bin Abu 'Ishaq, Abu Dawud, Abul-Hamra' (Muntakhab Theyl al-Mutheyl) p. ۸۳ .۳۳

.Mansur bin Abul-Aswad, Abu Dawud, Abul-Hamra' (Al-mu'jam ul- Kabir) p. ۱۳۴ .۳۴

.Abu 'Ishaq as-Subey'i, Abu Dawud, Abul-Hamra' (History of Islam) vol.۲ p. ۹۷ .۳۵

p: ۷۱

.Umayr Abu Arfaja, Atiyah (Usdul-Ghaba) vol.۳ p. ۴۱۳ .۳۶

Al-Aufi, Amr bin Atiyah and al-Husayn bin al-Hasan, from Atiyah (The History of . ۳۷ .Baghdad) vol.۹ p. ۱۲۶

.Bukeyr bin Mismaar, Aamir bin Sa'd, Sa'd (Jami'ul-Bayan) vol.۲۲ p. ۸ .۳۸

.Abu Balah Amr bin Maymun (Al-Mustadrak) vol.۳ p. ۱۳۲ .۳۹

Yahya bin Ubayd, Attar bin Abu Riyah, Umar bin Abu Salama (At-Tirmidhi's Sahih) vol.۱۳ .۴۰ .p. ۲۰۰

.Yahya bin Ubayd, Sahl bin Sa'd (Al-Isti'aab) vol.۲ p. ۴۶۰ .۴۱

.Abu Hurayra, Sahl bin Sa'd (Al-Isti'aab) vol.۲ p. ۵۶ .۴۲

.Bureyda al-Aslami, Sahl bin Sa'd (Al-Isti'aab) vol.۲p. ۵۶ .۴۳

.Abdullah bin Umar, Sahl bin Sa'd (Al-Isti'aab) vol.۲ p. ۵۶ .۴۴

.Imran bin al-Husayn, Sahl bin Sa'd (Al-Isti'aab) vol.۲ p. ۵۶ .۴۵

.Salama bin al-Aqua', Sahl bin Sa'd (Al-Isti'aab) vol.۲ p. ۵۶ .۴۶

Ma'qil bin Yasaar (At-Tirmidhi's Sahih) vol.۱۳ p. ۲۴۸ .۴۷

Finally, the tradition concerning the Qur'anic verse of purification and its being specifically about them (Peace be upon them), in the words of al Haddad al Hadhrami is one of the correct, famous, widespread, and well known traditions upon which all the umma has .agreed and seventeen of great Hadithists have confirmed that it was true

The Tenth Spurious Argument

THE INFALLIBILITY OF THE TWELVE IMAMS

Some people criticize the Shia for believing that the Imams of the honorable Prophet's .family were infallible

The answer

The Shia believe that the Imam, who has been appointed by Allah, must be infallible. Allah :says

p: ٧٢

Surely, I will make you an Imam of men. Ibrahim said, 'and of my offspring?' My covenant (does not include the unjust, said He. (۲:۱۲۴

And whoever goes beyond the limits of Allah, he indeed does injustice to his own soul. ((۶۵:۱

(And whoever exceeds the limits of Allah those are they that are the unjust. (۲:۲۲۹

Infallibility was a condition for the divine Imamate and it was limited, after Prophet Muhammad (s), to the Twelve Imams for no one else was infallible other than them according to consensus. In addition to this, the Qur'anic verse; Allah only desires to keep away uncleanness from you, O People of the House, and to purify you with a thorough purification. ۳۳:۳۳, confirms that Imam Ali, Imam Hasan and Imam Husayn were infallible. Many prophetic traditions also confirm the infallibility of the Twelve Imams (peace be .(upon them

The previously mentioned verse provides proof of the infallibility of the Prophet's family. It also shows that their purification is from Allah and is not a legislative matter, because the legislative will of purification from uncleanness does not concern the Prophet's family alone, but includes all people. The legislative will also concerns one's own actions whereas this Qur'anic verse shows that Allah's will in purifying these persons from any ,uncleanness is His creative will. Allah says

(His command, when He intends anything, is only to say to it, 'Be,' and so it is." (۳۶:۸۲"

Of course, what is intended by uncleanness is not bodily uncleanness, but the internal .uncleanness which is blasphemy, disbelief, guilt, disobedience, and everything sinful

p: ۷۳

.If one says that the purification might mean that Allah would forgive their sins

I would answer that forgiveness does not purify uncleanness from the soul of the disobedient, but it takes the punishment away from him. Besides, forgiving a sin would not exist unless the sin had been committed. So, the sinful is not purified during .committing the sin, while the Qur'anic verse indicates a complete purification

The Eleventh Spurious Argument

THE MIRACLES OF THE IMAMS

Some people criticize the Shias of believing that the Imams had miracles like the miracles .of the Prophets

The answer

What we mean by the miracles of the Imams is the charismata that prove their Imamate, guardianship, and their being a proof from Allah among mankind and the mediators between mankind and the Prophet (s). Refer to the book titled (Ithbatul-Hudat bin-Nusus wa al-Mu'jizaat). The author mentions the miracles of the Twelve Imams with well established narrations that have been extensively narrated with uninterrupted chains of narrators. Refer to Ihqaqul-Haq vol. ١١,١٢, and ١٩, if you like to know the miracles and charismata of the Imams as mentioned in Sunni books. It includes some of those mentioned in Sunni books with names of the books, the number of the pages and the .edition

The Twelfth Spurious Argument

NAMING PERSONS WITH NAMES SUCH AS ABDUN-NABI AND THE LIKE

Some criticize the Shias because they give their sons names like Abdun-Nabi —the Prophet's slave—, Abdur-Rasul —the Messenger's slave—, Abd Ali —the slave of Ali—, Abdul-Husayn —the slave of Husayn—, whereas such names are not permissible .because servantship for other than Allah is polytheism

p: ٧۴

The answer

Associationism is to worship other than Allah, either worshipping that thing alone or along with Allah. Worship is submitting to the worshipped taking it to be divine and godlike. However the mere using of the word servant in front of a created thing does not mean ,worshipping. The Holy Qur’an and many Prophetic traditions confirm this fact. Allah says

And marry those among you who are single and those who are fit among your male” (slaves and your female slaves.” (٢٤:٣٢

It does not mean that the slave worships his master. The same is said about names like Abdun-Nabi and Abdul-Husayn. At the same time, those who criticize the Shias for using these names, they themselves call their bosses ‘my master’ and they have no problem !with it

The Thirteenth Spurious Argument

LOVING THE PROPHET’S FAMILY

Some people spuriously argue that the Shia love the Prophet's family more than Allah and His Messenger Muhammad (s), and they believe that their love for them is enough to get .them into Paradise and save them from Hell

The answer

This is a great fabrication. The Shias love the Prophet’s family simply because they are the family of the Prophet (s) and for the sake of their love for the Prophet. Their love for the Prophet is simply because he is the Messenger of Allah. Therefore, it is irrational for the Shia to love the Prophet’s family more than they love the Prophet, and it is also .irrational for them to love the Prophet more than they love Allah

p: ٧٥

The Fourteenth Spurious Argument

EXEGESIS AND INTERPRETATION OF THE VERSES OF THE QUR'AN

Some people fabricate lies against the Shias claiming that they interpret the Qur'anic verses not according to what they mean but just to support their beliefs and to praise .their Imams

The answer

It is not possible to deny that there are many Qur'anic verses that either address the merits of Imam Ali alone or that of the rest of the Prophet's family members. There are many traditions in Sunni books interpreting many verses as addressing the merits of Imam Ali and the rest of the Prophet's family members. The author of Ihqaqul-Haq has collected in vol. ٣,٩, and ١۴ two hundred and fifty-five such verses, and after each verse he wrote down the traditions related in the books of the Sunnis that explains the verse with .the page numbers

The Fifteenth Spurious Argument

IMMODERATION

Some spuriously criticize the Shia for having an over excessive love for the Prophet's family and they diminish the dignity of the Companions because they prefer Imam Ali and .his family above all the other Companions

The answer

Many traditions mentioned in Sunni books show that Imam Ali had been preferred above all the other Companions. Prophet Muhammad (s) says: "Of whomsoever I had been ".guardian, Ali here is to be his guardian

He also said addressing Imam Ali: "You are to me as was Aaron to Moses, except that ".there will be no prophet after me

The tradition of 'the bird' shows that Imam Ali was the most beloved of Allah after His .(Messenger Muhammad (s

".The Prophet (s) said: "I am the city of knowledge and Ali is its gate

The Prophet Muhammad (s) ordered all the doors of his Companions that opened to the .mosque to be closed except the door of Imam Ali

".The prophet (s) said: "Ali and I are the fathers of this nation

".People are from various trees but I and Ali are from one tree"

".There are three veracious people and Ali bin Abu Talib is the best of them"

.Many other hadiths in this regard are mentioned in Sunni and Shiite reference books

The Prophet Muhammad (s) had instituted the bonds of brotherhood between his Companions and said to Ali, "You are my brother," as it was mentioned in Sunni books narrated by ibn Abbas, Sa'id bin al-Musayyab, ibn Umar, Zayd bin Abu Awfa, Anas bin Malik, Zayd bin Arqam, Hudhayfa bin al-Yaman, Makhduj bin Zayd, Abu Umama, Jami' bin .Umayr, Jabir bin Abdullah, Abu Sa'id, Abdur-Rahman bin Aweym and Abu Hurayra

Ahmad bin Hanbal mentioned in his book Faza'ilus-Sahaba a tradition narrated by Akrima, that was heard from ibn Abbas that the Prophet Muhammad (s) said: "There is no Qur'anic verse that begins with 'O you who believe,' without Ali being their (i.e. those who believe) head, leader, and their distinction. Allah has censured the Prophet's Companions ".in the Qur'an but He did not mention Ali save in praise

.The same was also mentioned in Dhakha'ir ul Uqba p. ٨٩, Egyptian Edition

p: ٧٧

It was also mentioned by at-Tabarani and ibn Abu Hatim in As-Sawa'iq ul-Muhriqa p. ۱۲۵; .Egyptian Edition, and Tarikh ul-Khulafa' (History of the Caliphs) p. ۱۱۶; Lahore Edition

Abu Na'im mentioned in his book Hilyatul- Awliya' vol.۱ p. ۶۴; Egyptian edition, a tradition narrated by ibn Abbas that the Prophet Muhammad (s) had said: "Allah had not revealed ".any verse beginning with 'O you who believe,' unless Ali was its head and amir

Ahmad bin Hanbal sums it up for Imam Ali when He said: "No one of the Prophet's ".Companions had virtues like that of Ali bin Abu Talib

This saying has been mentioned in many books; al-Mustadrak, al-Isti'aab, al-Kamil of ibn ul-Athir, Kifayat ut-Talib, ar-Riyazun-Nazira, Tahthib ut-Tahthib, Fat-hul-Bari fi Sharh il-Bukhari, Tarikh ul-Khulafa', as-Sira al-Halabiyah, ar-Rawzul-Azhar, Is'aaf ur-Raaghibin .and others

There is a tradition, which was agreed upon by the Sunnis showing the preference of .Fatima, the Prophet's daughter, (peace be upon her) over all others

".The Prophet said: "Fatima is the chief of women of Paradise

This hadith has been narrated by some Companions: Hudhayfa bin al-Yamaan as in Sahih ut-Tirmidhi vol. ۱۳ p. ۱۹۷, 'Aa'isha as in Sahih ul-Bukhari vol. ۴ p. ۲۰۳, and Umm Salama in .Sahih ut-Tirmidhi vol. ۱۳ p. ۲۵۰

There is also an agreed upon tradition among Sunnis showing the preference of Imam .Hasan and Imam Husayn

".The Prophet (s) said: "Hasan and Husayn are the masters of the young men of Paradise

This hadith was narrated by some Companions of the prophet: Abu Sa'id al-Khudri as in Sahih ut-Tirmidhi vol. ۱۳ p. ۱۹۰, Musnad of Ahmad vol. ۳ p. ۳., Hudhayfa as in Sahih ut-.Tirmidhi vol. ۱۳ p. ۱۹۷, and by Abdullah bin Umar in the Sunan of ibn Maja vol. ۱ p. ۵۶

p: ۷۸

The Sura Al-Insaan (٧۶) was revealed concerning Imam Ali, Fatima, Hasan and Husayn. In addition, the Qur'anic Verse of purification: "Allah only desires to keep away uncleanness from you, O People of the House, and to purify you with a thorough purification. (٣٣:٣٣)," was revealed concerning them. This has been narrated by many of the Prophet's Companions such as Wathila bin al-Asqa', Amr bin Abu Salama, 'Aa'isha, Umm Salama , Sa'd bin Abu Waqqas, Abu Sa'id, Imam Ali, Ja'far bin Abu Talib, Abu Barza, Sabih, ibn Abbas, Anas, Abul-Hamra', Atiyah, Sahl bin Sa'd, Abu Hurayra, Burayda, Abdullah bin Umar, Imran bin al-Husayn, Salama bin al-Aqua' , Ma'qil bin Yasaar, and Abdullah bin az-Zubeir. This has been mentioned by al-Heythami in his book Majma'uz-Zawa'id and as-Suyuti in his book al-Jami'us-Saghir narrated by al-Bazzaz p. ١١٣ and by ibn Hajar in his as-Sawa'iq ul-Muhriqa p. ١٨۴ and Miftah un-Naja p. ٩, Yanabi'ul-Mawaddah p. ١٨٧, al-Fat-hul-Kabir p. ١٣٣, Arjahul-Matalib p. ٣٣٠, as-Sayf ul-Yamani al-Maslul p. ٩. And it has also been narrated by Aamir bin Wathila, which was mentioned by al-Hafiz ad-Dulabi in his book al-Kuna wa al-Asma' vol. ١ p. ٧۶. It was narrated by Salama bin al-Aqua' which was mentioned by ibnul-Maghazili and ash-Shafi'i in his book al-Manaqib, and mentioned in other Sunni books like Arjah ul-Matalib p. ٣٣٠ and Yanabi'ul-Mawaddah p. ٢٨. Also it was narrated by Imam Ali, which was mentioned by Muhibbud-Din at-Tabari in his book .Dhakha'ir ul-Uqba p. ٢٠ from ibnus-Seri

The Sixteenth Spurious Argument

SHIA OPINION ABOUT HAFSA AND 'AA'ISHA

p: ٧٩

Some people spuriously criticize the Shias cursing the wives of Prophet Muhammad (s), especially 'Aa'isha (daughter of Abu Bakr; the first caliph) and Hafsa (daughter of Umar; the second caliph), and that they ascribe adultery to them, Allah forbid!

The answer

This is a great calumny. When did the Shias ascribe adultery to 'Aa'isha and Hafsa? This is definitely not true. In fact, they condemned their disobeying Allah and His Messenger and they have determined that they both indeed had disobeyed and broke the order of Allah and His Messenger. The Holy Qur'an has confirmed this. Allah says,

If you both turn to Allah, then indeed your hearts are already inclined (to this); and if you back up each other against him, then surely Allah it is Who is his Guardian, and Jibril and the believers that do good, and the angels after that are the aiders. (۶۶:۴)

The Shia condemn 'Aa'isha for encouraging Talha and az-Zubeir to break their homage to Imam Ali (a), when she gathered a group of hypocrites, mounted a camel, and set out with Talha and az-Zubeir to fight Imam Ali. Indeed, they fought him and were unjust to him.

The Seventeenth Spurious Argument

THE PEACE TREATY BETWEEN IMAM HASAN AND MU'AWIYA

Some criticize the Shias saying that Imam Hasan had made peace with Mu'awiya (the first Umayyad caliph) and put an end to the conflict between them, and that he did not listen to his Companions who wanted instead to involve him in sedition. To them this indicates that the policy of the Prophet's family towards his Companions was not a hostile policy at all as the Shia claim.

p: ٨٠

The answer

When Imam Hasan bin Ali set about making peace with Mu'awiya and ending the war with him, he was not going against the policy of his father (Imam Ali). Imam Hasan's army by that time had become weak, discord had erupted within the ranks, and many of them refused to obey him. Many men were overcome by greed and sided with Mu'awiya. Imam Hasan (a) knew that the war with Mu'awiya would not be for his benefit and it would cause the shedding of Muslim blood and the killing of the followers of the Prophet's family; therefore, he was obliged to make peace with Mu'awiya in order to spare their .blood

However Imam Hasan was never agreeable with Mu'awiya being the caliph of the Muslims. His exalted personality could never have accepted such a claim. Anyone who knows anything about the circumstances of the peace treaty between Imam Hasan and Mu'awiya would be certain that Imam Hasan, his father, and his brother (Imam Husayn) .thought that Mu'awiya and all the Umayyads were of the same ilk without any difference

The Eighteenth Spurious Argument

SWEARING BY THE PROPHET AND THE IMAMS

Some people spuriously find fault with the Shias because they swear by Prophet Muhammad, the Imams and by their progeny whereas swearing by any other than Allah .is null and void

The answer

No one has ever said—even from among our Sunni brothers—that swearing by other than Allah is forbidden. It is something common among people to swear by anyone dear to them like their sons and others. How it would be forbidden when it has been mentioned :many times in the Holy Qur'an? Allah says

p: ٨١

(I swear by the fig and the olive and Mount Sinai and this city made secure. (٩٥:١-٣

(I swear by the soul and Him Who made it perfect. (٩١:٧

Of course, in the Sharia a legal oath (e.g an oath given in court or an oath on a legal document) by other than Allah or His attributes is not acceptable. This is a legal oath and .anything other than this is considered to be only a manner of emphasizing a point

The Nineteenth Spurious Argument

THE CRITERION FOR ACCEPTING AND REJECTING HADITHS

Some people launch spurious attacks against the Shia claiming that they don't accept traditions narrated by some of the Companions, they do not accept the Sunni books of traditions, such as the six main (Sahih) books. They claim that the Shia do not depend upon the traditions mentioned in such books, and that they do not quote traditions from them except when they want to refute them. Instead, they depend only upon the .(traditions narrated by the Prophet's family (peace be upon them

The answer

Shia jurisprudence with respect to proving the veracity of one-way related information is based upon the chain of its narrators, whether or not they were trustworthy, no matter it had been mentioned in a Shia or Sunni book. Having a book called Sahih (i.e. Correct) is not sufficient, every one of the narrators of that tradition must be proven to have been trustworthy regardless of whether he was Shiite or Sunni, or whether or not it had been :mentioned in Shiite or Sunni books. Allah says

p: ٨٢

(O you who believe! If an evildoer comes to you with a report, look carefully into it. (۴۹:۶

(And follow not that of which you have not the knowledge. (۱۷:۳۶

In their jurisprudence, the Shia depend upon the traditions narrated by the Prophet's family because they were the authority for the nation after Prophet Muhammad (s). This is confirmed by the prophetic tradition of Thaqalayn, the two weighty matters upon which .all Muslims agree

We have mentioned this tradition in our book (Al-Jami' li Barahin Usul ul-I'tiqadat). At-Tirmidhi mentioned this tradition in his book (Sahih) vol. ۱۳ p. ۲۰۰, narrated by Zayd bin Arqam and in another chain by Abu Sa'id that Prophet Muhammad (s) had said: "I have left to you two very weighty matters. If you keep to them, you will never go astray after my death. One, the greater than the other is the Holy Qur'an, which is as a string extended between Heaven and Earth, and the other is my family. They will never separate until they come to me in Paradise. Be careful how to obey me through obeying ".them

Some Sunni scholars have certified this tradition and its many sources. One of them was ibn Hajar in his book titled As-Sawa'iq. He said: "The tradition of ath-Thaqalayn has been ".narrated by thirteen Companions. Many of its chains of narration are true and correct

:It was also mentioned by al-Hadhrami in his book titled Al-Qawlul-Fasl vol. ۱ p. ۴۹. He said

p: ۸۳

The tradition of ath-Thaqalayn was narrated by more than twenty Companions. Its" chains of narration were true and acceptable. It was a mutawatir tradition meaning that the tradition had an uninterrupted sequence of trustworthy narrators. All scholars of ".hadith have said that this was a true tradition

The profusion of narrations of this tradition has led to the conclusion that it was said by Prophet Muhammad (s) on four occasions. The first occasion was the Day of Arafah when he made a speech from above his she-camel, al-Quswa, the second was at the Kheif Mosque, the third was on the Day of al-Ghadir when he was returning from his last hajj, .and the fourth, on the day of his death when he gave a sermon on the pulpit

Here are some of the paths by which this tradition has been narrated from the books of ;the Sunnis

Narrated by al-A'mash, from Atiyah, from Abu Sa'id- (mentioned by ibn Sa'd in his book.١ .Tabaqat) vol.٢ p. ١١۴

.From another direction, al-A'mash, Atiyah, Abu Sa'id, (al-Maghazili's Manaqib) p. ٢٣۵ .٢

.From a third direction, al-A'mash, Atiyah, Abu Sa'id (al-Maghazili's Manaqib) p. ٢٣۵ .٣

.(Ibn Numayr, Abdul-Malik bin Abu Sulayman, Atiyah, Abu Sa'id (Ahmad's Manaqib .۴

Ali bin Musahir, Abdul-Malik bin Abu Sulayman, Atiyah, Abu Sa'id (al-Mu'jam ul-Kabir) p. .۵ .١٣٧

.Harun bin Sa'd, Atiyah, Abu Sa'id (al-Mu'jam us-Saghir) vol.١ p. ١٣۵ .۶

.Fuzeil bin Marzuq, Atiyah, Abu Sa'id (al-Ma'rifa wa at-Tarikh) p. ۵٣٧ .٧

p: ٨۴

۸. Kutheir an-Nawaa’, Atiyah, Abu Sa’id (al-Mu’jam us Saghir) p. ۷۳.

۹. Abu Isra’il, Atiyah, Abu Sa’id (al-Ma’rifa wa at-Tarikh) p. ۵۳۷.

۱۰. Muhammad bin Muzaffar al-Baghdadi, Abu Sa’id (Miftah un-Naja) p. ۵۱.

۱۱. Salman ul-Farsi (Yanabi’ul-Mawaddah) p. ۳۶.

۱۲. Ja’far bin Aun, Abu Hayyan, Yazid bin Hayyan, Zayd bin Arqam (ad-Darimi’s Sunan) vol. ۲ p. ۴۳۱.

۱۳. Ya’la bin Ubayd, Abu Hayyan, Yazid bin Hayyan, Zayd bin Arqam (al-Bayhaqi’s Sunan) vol. ۱۰ p. ۱۱۳.

۱۴. Isma’il bin Ibrahim, Abu Hayyan, Yazid bin Hayyan, Zayd bin Arqam (Muslim’s Sahih) vol. ۷ p.۱۲۲.

۱۵. Muhammad bin Fuzeil and Jarir, Abu Hayyan, Yazid bin Hayyan, Zayd bin Arqam (Muslim’s Sahih) vol.۷ p.۱۲۳.

۱۶. Ali bin Musahhir, Abu Hayyan, Yazid bin Hayyan, Zayd bin Arqam (Ibnul-Maghazili’s Manaqib) p. ۲۳۶.

۱۷. Hasaan bin Sa’id, ibn Masruq, Yazid bin Hayyan, Zayd bin Arqam (Muslim’s Sahih) vol. ۷ p. ۱۲۳.

۱۸. Al-A’mash, Yazid bin Hayyan (Al-Mu’jam ul-Kabir) vol. ۵ p. ۱۹۰.

۱۹. Abu Sa’id, Habib bin Abu Thabit, Zayd bin Arqam (At-Tirmidhi’s Sahih) vol.۱۳ p. ۲۰۰.

۲۰. Al-A’mash, Habib bin Abu Thabit, Zayd bin Arqam (Al-mu’jam ul- Kabir) vol. ۵ p. ۱۹۰.

۲۱. Al-A’mash, Abuz-Zuha, Zayd bin Arqam (Al-Mu’jam ul- Kabir) vol. ۵ p. ۱۹۰.

۲۲. From another direction to Abuz-Zuha, Zayd bin Arqam (Al-Mu’jam ul- Kabir) vol. ۵ p. ۱۹۰.

p: ۸۵

.From a third way to Abuz-Zuha, Zayd bin Arqam (Al-Mu'jam ul- Kabir) vol. ۵ p. ۱۹۰ .۲۳

.Al-Hasan bin Abdullah, Muslim bin Subayh, Zayd bin Arqam (Al-Mustadrak) vol.۳ p. ۱۴۸ .۲۴

.Kuheil, Abut-Tufayl, Zayd bin Arqam (Wasilat ul-Ma'al) p. ۵۵ .۲۵

.Habib bin Abu Thabit, Abut-Tufayl, Zayd bin Arqam (Al-Mustadrak) vol.۳ p. ۱۰۹ .۲۶

.Hakam bin Jubayr, Abut-Tufayl, Zayd bin Arqam (Al-Mu'jam ul- Kabir) p. ۱۳۷ .۲۷

.Ali bin Rabi'a, Zayd bin Arqam (Al-Ma'rifa wa at-Tarikh) p. ۵۳۶ .۲۸

.Al-Husayn bin Abdullah, Zayd bin Arqam (Fara'id us-Samtein) vol.۲ p. ۱۴۲ .۲۹

.Zayd bin Thabit (Al-Mu'jam ul- Kabir) vol. ۵ p. ۱۷۱ .۳۰

.From another direction to Zayd bin Thabit (Al-Mu'jam ul- Kabir) vol. ۵ p. ۱۷۱ .۳۱

.From a third direction to Zayd bin Thabit (Al-Mu'jam ul- Kabir) vol. ۵ p. ۱۷۱ .۳۲

.From a fourth direction to Zayd bin Thabit (Al-Mu'jam ul- Kabir) vol. ۵ p. ۱۷۱ .۳۳

Al-Anmati, Ma'ruf bin Kharbuth, Abu Tufayl, Hudhayfa bin Usayd (Al-Mu'jam ul- Kabir) .۳۴
.p. ۱۵۷

Zayd bin al-Hasan, Ma'ruf bin Kharbuth, Abu Tufeil, Hudhayfa bin Usayd (Fara'id us- .۳۵
.Samtein) vol.۲ p. ۵۷۴

.Ahmad bin Abdullah bin Salam, Hudhayfa bin al-Yaman (Yanabi'ul-Mawaddah) p. ۳۵ .۳۶

.Urwa bin Kharija, Fatimat uz-Zahra' (peace be upon her) (Yanabi'ul-Mawaddah) p. ۳۰ .۳۷

Ja'far bin Muhammad, from his father, from Jabir bin Abdullah (At-Tirmidhi's Sahih) .۳۸
.vol.۱۳ p. ۱۹۹

p: ۸۶

.Abdur-Rahman bin Khallad, Jabir bin Abdullah (Yanabi'ul-Mawaddah) p. ۴۰ .۳۹

(Al-Husayn bin Ali (s) from Imam Ali (s) (Fara'id us-Samtein .۴۰

.Aabir) bin Wathila, Imam Ali (Ibnul-Maghazili's Manaqib) p. ۱۱۷) .۴۱

.Muhammad bin Umar bin Ali from his father, Imam Ali (Kanz ul-Ummal) vol.۱ p. ۳۴۰ .۴۲

Ubaydullah bin Musa, from his father, from his grandfather, from Imam Ali (Wasilat ul- .۴۳ .Ma'al) p. ۵۷

.Asbagh bin Nabata, Imam Ali (Yanabi'ul-Mawaddah) p. ۳۹ .۴۴

.Sulaym bin Qays, Imam Ali (Yanabi'ul-Mawaddah) p. ۱۱۴ .۴۵

.Asbagh bin Nabata, Abu Rafi' (Yanabi' ul Mawaddah) p. ۳۹ .۴۶

.Muhammad bin Abdur-Rahman bin Khallad (Arjah ul-Matalib) p. ۳۴۱ .۴۷

.Hudhayfa bin al-Yaman (Yanabi' ul Mawaddah) p. ۳۶ .۴۸

.Talha (Yanabi' ul Mawaddah) p. ۳۵ .۴۹

.Abdur-Rahman bin Auf (Yanabi' ul Mawaddah) p. ۳۵ .۵۰

.Sa'd bin Abu Waqqas (Yanabi' ul Mawaddah) p. ۳۵ .۵۱

. (Ibn A'atham al-Kufi, Ibn Abbas (As-Safina .۵۲

.Ata', Abu Yahya, Ibn Abbas (Yanabi' ul Mawaddah) p. ۳۵ .۵۳

.Abdullah bin al-Hasan, from his father, al-Hasan bin Ali (s) (Yanabi' ul Mawaddah) p. ۲۰ .۵۴

.Anas, (Yanabi' ul Mawaddah) p. ۱۹۱ .۵۵

.Abu Rafi'; the freed slave of Prophet Muhammad (s) (Arjah ul-Matalib) p. ۳۳۷ .۵۶

.Jubayr bin Mut'im, (Yanabi'ul Mawaddah) p. ۳۱ .۵۷

p: ۸۷

.Abdullah bin Huntub (Ihya'ul-Meyyit) p. ١١۵ .۵٨

.Sakhra al-Aslami (Yanabi'ul Mawaddah) p. ٣٨ .۵٩

.Abd bin Hamid (Yanabi' ul Mawaddah) p. ٣٨ .۶٠

.Abu Dharr (Al-Mu'jam ul- Kabir) vol. ۵ p. ۵٣٨ .۶١

.Abu Hurayra (Majma'uz-Zawa'id) vol. ٩ p. ١۶٣ .۶٢

.Um Hani (Wasilatul-Ma'al) p. ۵٩ .۶٣

.Umm Salama (Arjah ul-Matalib) p. ٣٣٨ and (Yanabi' ul Mawaddah) p. ٣۶ .۶۴

It should be mentioned that the tradition (I have left to you two very important things; the Holy Qur'an and my Sunna,) which the Sunnis put to be against the tradition of Thaqalayn was not mentioned in any of their six Sahih books and it could not be narrated by any Companion who was in opposition to the Prophet's family, because the motto of Prophet's family was the Prophet's Sunna, while the motto of the Companions who were '.in opposition was 'The Holy Qur'an is enough for us

They prevented people to write down or narrate the Prophet's Sunna during the reigns of Abu Bakr, Umar and Uthman. They collected all what had been written down and burnt them. They punished people for narrating the Prophet's traditions except what they .themselves narrated

The Twentieth Spurious Argument

REJECTING ANALOGY AND DISCRETION

Some people erroneously criticize the Shias in that they reject analogy and discretion, and the expediencies transmitted in jurisprudence upon which the Companions and their successors depended. They also criticize the Shia of accusing those who adopt these methods as using analogy just as did Iblis (the Devil) who said to Allah, "I am better than (he (Adam), Thou hast created me of fire, while him Thou didst create of clay. ٧:١٢

p: ٨٨

The answer

Analogy means proving a verdict on a matter of Sharia simply based upon its similarity in some ways to another matter. It is obvious that the mere similarity between two things does not require them having the same verdict. There are many subjects in the Sharia .that are similar in some way or other but have different verdicts

Discretion means regarding an act as approvable or not approving a deed and then issuing the appropriate verdict according to personal discretion. This is clear innovation, for innovation is nothing but linking that which is one approves to the Sharia and issuing a !verdict that considers personal discretion as a part of the Sharia

This is definitely unacceptable when we know that no Sunni, except for the Mu'tazilites, has ever committed himself to subordinate the laws of the Sharia to the personal .advantage of the individual and his personal disadvantage

It is true that we — who believe in reason — are partisans of justice and are duty bound by it. However, how can any jurist comprehend the advanteges and rulings behind Allah's acts? Allah is aware of advantages and disadvantages to an infinite degree, but the deficient minds of human beings cannot realize them to this degree. They therefore cannot find out Allah's rulings simply by taking into consideration some advantage or .disadvantage in an action

Indeed, if a transmitted text explains the general cause of a ruling, it proves that the cause is not limited to what is only in the text, but it will include others having the same .cause

p: ۸۹

They fell into innovation because they turned away from the path of knowing the Islamic Law which the Prophet (s) had determined for the Muslims. He said, "I am leaving to you two weighty things; the Holy Qur'an and my family. You will not go astray if you keep to them." He made his family the guide for Muslims like the Holy Qur'an and told them that they (his family) were the depositories of the knowledge of the Sharia. He (s) said: "I am ".the city of knowledge and Ali is its gate

Imam Ali (a) said: "The Messenger of Allah had taught me one thousand sections of ".knowledge from each one thousand sections are opened

.Imam Ali deposited this knowledge with the Infallible Imams and each in turn inherited it

The Twenty-first Spurious Argument

JOINING THE PRAYERS

Some people criticize the Shia for combining the five prayers offering them at only three times. They combine the Zhuhr and Asr Prayers and the Maghrib and 'Isha Prayers, .whereas the Prophet (s) and Muslims offer them at their five specified times

The answer

According to the opinion of the majority of scholars, it has been established that the Prophet (s) combined the Zhuhr and Asr Prayers without fear (of war) or traveling. The author of Jami'ul-Usul vol. ۶ p. ۴۵۹ quoting from the Sahih of Muslim says, "The Prophet (s) offered the Zhuhr and Asr Prayers at one time without being in a state of fear or while traveling." He added that az-Zubeir said, "I asked Sa'id, 'Why did the Prophet (s) do that?' He answered, 'I asked ibn Abbas about this and he answered: The Prophet (s) did not want to cause difficulty for the umma." In another quotation, he added, '...without fear '.and there was no rain

p: ۹۰

It has been established from the traditions of the Infallible Imams that when the sun passes the zenith, it is the time for the two prayers but this (the first prayer) is before that (the second prayer). Similarly, when the evening comes, it is time for the two prayers but .this is before that

Allah has permitted the joining of the prayers and His Messenger did so without any purpose other than of making it easy for his umma. Why should Muslims have to make it difficult upon themselves just to make the separation of the prayers obligatory and sometimes miss the Asr and the 'Isha Prayers which has happened not only to ordinary ?people but to some of the Sunni scholars as well

The Twenty-Second Spurious Argument

TEMPORARY MARRIAGE

Some people spuriously criticize the Shias for permitting temporary marriage while they .think that it is a ruling that has been repealed

The answer

.The Holy Qur'an has permitted temporary marriage

:Allah says

then as to such wives as you enjoy thereby, give them their dowries as . . . (approportionate. (۴:۲۴

No Qur'anic verse has repealed this form of marriage. Apart from this, it has not been .proven that the Prophet (s) had ever repealed it

The author of Jami'ul-Usul vol. ١٢ p. ١٣۵ (tradition No. ٨٩۵٣) quotes Jabir bin Abdullah from the Sahih of Muslim as saying, "We practised temporary marriage for a handful of dates and flour during the time of the Prophet and the time of Abu Bakr until Umar forbade it ".because of the problem of Amr bin Hurayth

:(He also recorded in vol. ٣ p. ۴۶۵ (tradition No. ١۴٠۶

In the Sahih of Muslim and the Sahih of an-Nassa'i, there was another tradition that" relates Abu Dharr as saying, 'The two pleasures (mut'atan) are not applicable except for '.us

".He meant that of the temporary marriage and that of hajj

:Ar-Razi mentioned, in his Tafsir vol. ١٠ p. ٢۵

The third evidence on permitting temporary marriage is based upon that which Umar" (may Allah be pleased with him) said from atop the minbar (pulpit) 'Two pleasures were permissible at the time of the Prophet but now I forbid them; the pleasure of hajj and the '.temporary marriage

This confirms that temporary marriage was permissible in the time of the Prophet (s). Umar's saying 'I forbid them' indicates that it was not the Prophet but Umar who repealed them. Thus proven, we can say that this is a proof of the fact that temporary marriage had ben permissible during the time of the Prophet and that he (s) did not repeal it, but Umar did. Therefore, Umar's repeal is invalid. This was the evidence that Imran bin Husayn cited with when He said: "Allah revealed a Qur'anic verse about temporary marriage and He had not repealed it by any other verse. The Prophet (s) ordered us to practise temporary marriage and he did not forbid it. But someone gave his opinion as he ".-liked -he meant that Umar forbade it

.These have been some ways of proving the legality of the temporary marriage

p: ٩٢

:The Twenty–Third Spurious Argument

THE ORIGIN OF SHIISM

Some people fabricate lies against the Shias claiming that Shiism is a new doctrine and .that it was originated by the influence of the Persian Magi and the Jews

The answer

Neither the following of Imam Ali nor is Shiism a new thing. In the Prophetic traditions mentioned in the books of our Sunni brothers, Imam Ali's followers were called the Shia of .Ali

We have mentioned enough traditions in our book Mawsu'atul-Mahaasin wa al-Masaawi' .fil-Islam-Encyclopaedia of Merits and Offences in Islam

Ibn Hajar said in his book as-Sawa'iq ul-Muhriqa p. ۹۶ –Egyptian edition-, that ad-Daylami ,mentioned a tradition saying that the Prophet (s) said

O Ali, Allah has forgiven you, your progeny, your wives and your Shia (followers). Be" ..."delighted

The same hadith has been mentioned by ibnul-Maghazili in his book al-Manaqib, al-Hamawini in Fara'id us-Samtayn, al-Manaawi in Kunuz ul-Haqaayiq p. ۲۰۲, al-Qanduzi in Yanabi' ul Mawaddah p. ۲۷۰, Abu Bakr bin Shihab in Rashfat us-Sadi p. ۸۱, -Egyptian .edition- and others

,Furthermore, ad-Daylami recorded that the Prophet (s) said

O Ali, you and your Shia will come to me at the Pond in Paradise quenched with shining" ".faces, while your enemies will come to me thirsty and necks thrust forth

This very tradition has been mentioned by al-Manaawi in Kunuz ul-Haqaayiq p. ۲۰۳, -Bolaq edition-, by al-Qanduzi al-Hanafi in Yanaabi' ul Mawaddah p. ۱۸۲, -Egyptian edition-, and .-Muhammad Saalih at-Tirmidhi in al-Manaaqib ul-Murtazawiyya p. ۱۰۱, -Bombay Edition

p: ۹۳

Ad-Daylami mentioned in his book Firdous ul-Akhbar that Umm Salama (the Prophet's wife) said that the Prophet (s) had said:

".Ali and his Shia –followers- are the winners on the Day of Resurrection"

The same was also mentioned by al-Manaawi in Kunuz ul-Haqa'iq p. ۹۸, and al-Qanduzi in Yanabi' ul Mawaddah p. ۱۸۸ and ۲۳۷, -Istanbul Edition-.

Sabt bin al-Jawzi has mentioned in his book Tadhkirat ul-Khawaas p. ۵۹, a tradition narrated by Abu Sa'id al-Khudri that the Prophet (s) looked at Ali bin Abu Talib and said:

".This Man and his Shia are the winners on the Day of Resurrection"

Al-Khatib al-Khawarizmi mentioned in al-Manaaqib p. ۱۷۸ that the Master of Narrators, Abu Mansur Shahrdar bin Shirwayh bin Shahrdar told him in his letter from Hamadan that Abul-Fat'h Abdus bin Abdullah bin Abdus al-Hamadani told him that Sharif Abu Talib al-Mufazzal bin Muhammad bin Tahir al-Ja'fari (may Allah be pleased with him) in his house in Isfahan, Sikkatul-Khawr that Sheikh Abu Bakr Ahmad bin Musa bin Mardwayh bin Fawrak al-Isfahani told him that Ahmad bin Muhammad bin as-Sariy told him that al-Munthir bin Muhammad bin al-Munthir told him that his father told him that his uncle al-Husayn bin Sa'd told him that his father told him that Isma'il bin Ziyad al-Bazzaz told him that Ibrahim bin Muhajir told him that Yazid bin Shurahil al-Ansari, Imam Ali's clerk, told him that he had heard Imam Ali (a) saying,

The Prophet (s) said to me while he was leaning on my chest, O Ali, you have heard Allah's saying: Those who believe and do good; they are surely the best of men. (۹۸:۷)

p: ۹۴

They are you and your Shia. My rendezvous and yours will be at the Pond when the nations gather for the Judgement and you (and your Shias) will come with honor and ".radiant

This tradition was also mentioned by as-Suyuti in his ad-Durr ul-Manthur vol. ۶ p. ۳۷۹ -.-Egyptian edition

Al-Khatib ul-Baghdadi mentioned in his Muwazzih Awham uj-Jam' wa at-Tafriq vol. ۱ p. ۴۳; Heidarabad, that Abul-Hasan Muhammad bin Abdul-Wahid bin Muhammad bin Ja'far told him that Ali bin Umar ad-Darqutni told them that Abul-Hasan Ali bin Muhammad bin Ubayd told them that Ahmad bin Hazim told them that Sahl bin Aamir told them that Fuzeil bin Marzuq heard from Abul Jihaf, from Muhammad bin Amr bin al-Hasan, from Zaynab, ,from Fatima the daughter of the Prophet (as) that the Prophet said to Ali

".O Abul-Hasan (Ali), you and your Shia will be in Paradise"

Al-Haythami mentioned in his book Majma'uz-Zawa'id vol. ۱۰ p. ۲۱ -Egyptian edition-, that Umm Salama said: "When the Prophet (s) was in my house one night, Fatima and Ali sat with him. He raised his head towards them and said, "O Ali, be delighted. You and your ".Shia will be in Paradise

He also mentioned, in vol. ۹ p. ۱۷۳, a tradition narrated by Abu Hurayra that the Prophet (s) ".said to Ali, 'You and your Shia are with me in Paradise

The same was mentioned by al-Khatib al-Baghdadi in his The History of Baghdad vol. ۱۲ p. .-۲۸۹ -Egyptian edition

p: ۹۵

Ibnul-Maghazili ash-Shafie has mentioned, in al-Manaqib p. ۲۹۳ tradition No. ۳۳۵, that the judge Abu Ja'far Muhammad bin Isma'il al-Alawi told them that Abu Muhammad bin Abdullah bin Muhammad bin Ithman al-Muzani, who was called ibnus-Saqqa' told them that Abu Abdullah Ahmad bin Ali al-Razi told them that Ali bin al-Hasan bin Ubayd ar-Razi told them that Isma'il bin Ibban al-Azdi told them that he heard a tradition narrated by Amr bin Hurayth, from Dawud bin Sulayk, from Anas bin Malik that the Prophet (s) had ,said

Seventy thousand from among my umma will enter Paradise without there being any" reckoning." Then he looked at Ali and said: "They are from your Shia and you are their ".Imam

This hadith was mentioned by al-Khawarizmi in his al-Manaqib p. ۲۲۹, ibn Hasnawayh al-Musily in Durr Bahr il-Manaqib p. ۱۱۹, and al-Qanduzi in Yanabi' ul Mawaddah p. ۱۲۴.

Besides, these traditions are the historical facts that the Sunni books and history have certified. They have demonstrated that Shiism originated just after the Prophet's death when some people exploited the situation when Imam Ali and the Prophet's family were occupied with the Prophet's funeral preparations. In spite of the fact that the Prophet had recommended Ali to be his successor and that they had paid homage to Ali in Ghadir Khum, they arranged to give their allegiance to Abu Bakr as caliph after the Prophet (s). This prompted Imam Ali and his followers to protest and refuse to pay homage to Abu Bakr. This led Umar to attack the house of Fatima, the Prophet's Daughter, and set it on fire. Other accidents happened after that. Since then, those who had supported Imam Ali (a) came to be known as the Shia of Ali (followers) and their doctrine came to be known as Shiism. There were no Jews or Magi among them. The ruling authorities persecuted them .whereas Jews and Christians were best liked by the State

p: ۹۶

It was allowed for Ka'bul-Ahbar (previously a Jew) and the like to sit in the Prophet's Mosque and to talk to Muslims about Jewish ideas. The ruling authorities allowed storytellers to sit in the mosques and tell Jewish, Christian, and pre-Islamic stories, and they encouraged poets to recite poems about love, wine, praise and satire. At the same time, the ruling authorities prevented the Prophet's family and others to publicize the Prophetic traditions, giving the excuse that they might be mixed with Qur'anic verses!

Finally, we do not have save Allah to judge.

About center

In the name of Allah

هَلْيَسْتَوِيالَّذِينَيَعْلَمُونَوَالَّذِينَلَايَعْلَمُونَ

?Are those who know equal to those who do not know

al-Zumar: ٩

:Introduction

Ghaemiyeh Computer Research Institute of Isfahan, from ٢٠٠٧, under the authority of Ayatollah Haj SayyedHasanFaqihImami (God blesses his soul), by sincere and daily efforts of university and seminary elites and sophisticated groups began its activities in .religious, cultural and scientific fields

:Manifesto

Ghaemiyeh Computer Research Institute of Isfahan in order to facilitate and accelerate the accessibility of researchers to the books and tools of research, in the field of Islamic science, and regarding the multiplicity and dispersion of active centers in this field and numerous and inaccessible sources by a mere scientific intention and far from any kind of social, political, tribal and personal prejudices and currents, based on performing a project in the shape of (management of produced and published works from all Shia centers) tries to provide a rich and free collection of books and research papers for the experts, and helpful contents and discussions for the educated generation and all classes .of people interested in reading, with various formats in the cyberspace

:Our Goals are

(propagating the culture and teachings of Thaqalayn (Quran and Ahlulbayt p.b.u.t-

encouraging the populace particularly the youth in investigating the religious issues-

replacing useful contents with useless ones in the cellphones, tablets and computers-

providing services for seminary and university researchers-

spreading culture study in the publich-

paving the way for the publications and authors to digitize their works-

:Policies

acting according to the legal licenses-

relationship with similar centers-

avoiding parallel working-

merely presenting scientific contents-

mentioning the sources-

.It's obvious that all the responsibilities are due to the author

:Other activities of the institute

Publication of books, booklets and other editions-

Holding book reading competitions-

Producing virtual, three dimensional exhibitions, panoramas of religious and tourism-places

.Producing animations, computer games and etc-

Launching the website with this address: www.ghaemiyeh.com-

Fabricatingdramatic and speech works-

Launching the system of answering religious, ethical and doctrinal questions-

Designing systems of accounting, media and mobile, automatic and handy systems, web-kiosks

Holding virtual educational courses for the public-

Holding virtual teacher-training courses-

Producing thousands of research software in three languages (Persian, Arabic and-English) which can be performed in computers, tablets and cellphones and available and downloadable with eight international formats: JAVA, ANDROID, EPUB, CHM, PDF, HTML, CHM, GHB on the website

Also producing four markets named "Ghaemiyeh Book Market" with Android, IOS,-WINDOWS PHONE and WINDOWS editions

:Appreciation

We would appreciate the centers, institutes, publications, authors and all honorable .friends who contributed their help and data to us to reach the holy goal we follow

:Address of the central office

Isfahan, Abdorazaq St, Haj Mohammad JafarAbadei Alley, Shahid Mohammad HasanTavakkoly Alley, Number plate ۱۲۹, first floor

Website: www.ghbook.ir

Email: Info@ghbook.ir

Central office Tel: ۰۹۱۳۲۰۰۰۱۰۹

۰۲۱ ـ Tehran Tel: ۸۸۳۱۸۷۲۲

Commerce and sale: ۰۹۱۳۲۰۰۰۱۰۹

Users’ affairs: ۰۹۱۳۲۰۰۰۱۰۹

Introduction of the Center – Ghaemiyeh Digital Library